# 1992-1996 FINDINGS OF THE COLD WAR WORKING GROUP

# <u>INTRODUCTION</u>

Accounting for American crews missing from Cold War aircraft losses has been one of the principal goals of the Commission. Accounting for Soviet crews missing from Cold War losses and for Soviet POW/MIAs from the conflict in Afghanistan has been of equal importance in the Commission's work. The Cold War Working Group of the Commission was established in 1993 with A. Denis Clift, President of the Joint Military Intelligence College, designated as the American Co-chairman and General-Lieutenant Anatolii Krayushkin, Directorate Chief of the Federal Security Service, designated as the Russian Co-chairman. In 1996 Colonel Vladimir Konstantinovich Vinogradov replaced General Krayushkin on the Russian side. By mutual agreement of the two sides of the Commission, the Cold War Working Group has focused on ten specific incidents involving U.S. aircraft with eighty nine crew members unaccounted for:

- 8 April 1950, PB4Y2 Privateer shot down over the Baltic Sea, 10 unaccounted for.
- 6 November 1951, P2V Neptune shot down over the Sea of Japan, 10 unaccounted for.
- 13 June 1952, RB-29 shot down over the Sea of Japan, 12 unaccounted for.
- 7 October 1952, RB-29 shot down over the Pacific Ocean, 7 unaccounted for.
- 29 July 1953, RB-50 shot down over the Sea of Japan, 13 unaccounted for.
- 17 April 1955, RB-47 shot down over the Bering Sea, 3 unaccounted for.
- 10 September 1956, RB-50 lost over the Sea of Japan, 16 unaccounted for.
- 2 September 1958, C-130 shot down over Armenia, 13 unaccounted for.
- 1 July 1960, RB-47 shot down over the Barents Sea, 3 unaccounted for.
- 14 December 1965, RB-57 lost over the Black Sea, 2 unaccounted for.

Cooperation which could not have been imagined during the Cold War era has enabled us to obtain information regarding the ten incidents that simply was not available in earlier times. However, there are still very important questions which remain unanswered. This report is on the work we have conducted from 1992 to mid-1996, the results that we have achieved thus far, and areas where further

work is still required. Through archival research, interviews and field investigations important information has been developed, as is reported in the status reports on each of these incidents in Sections 1-10 of this portion of the Commission's report.

To summarize these findings, as a result of access to Russian archival material and of the research conducted thus far more than 80 primary Soviet source documents have been obtained which contain some 200 pages of information of the highest authority relating to the incidents as well as charts and, in one case, gun-camera photography. As work to locate additional documentation continues, the U.S. side will continue to press for fuller access to all relevant Russian archives.

Scores of interviews with Soviet pilots who participated in the shootdowns as well as with other participants, witnesses and knowledgeable individuals have provided first-hand accounts of these Cold War incidents. The Commission has undertaken field trips across Russia as well as in the former republics of the Soviet Union. Witnesses to the loss of the RB-29 on 7 October 1952, for example, provided testimony which led to the field investigation, recovery and repatriation of the remains of Captain John Robertson Dunham, USAF.

The Commission also conducted a field investigation of the 2 September 1958 loss of a C-130 near Yerevan in Soviet Armenia, visiting the crash site in August 1993, interviewing witnesses and coordinating a detailed investigation by forensic anthropologists from the U.S. Army Central Identification Laboratory Hawaii (CILHI). This investigation is documented in Section 8. Field investigations of the Cold War incidents will continue.

In the course of its work the U.S. side has pressed the Russian side repeatedly for access to Border Guards archives in the belief that Soviet Border Guards units would have played a role or, at least, been fully aware of the circumstances surrounding each of these incidents. The testimony of Border Guards sailor Vasiliy Saiko, which led to the recovery of Captain John Dunham's remains, supports the view held by the U.S. side. At the request of the U.S. co-Chairman of the Cold War Working Group, Ambassador Toon wrote to the Chief of the Russian Border Guards specifically requesting the Border Guards play a more active role in the work of the Commission. No response to this request was received. The Border Guards declined to participate stating that all relevant

information had already been provided to the Commission. Standing U.S. questions relating to the Border Guards were again passed to the Russian side at the February 1996 Technical Talks.

The Cold War Working Group has addressed the Russian side's request for information on its servicemen missing from the conflict in Afghanistan, as reported in Section 11 of this report. The United States has provided important, detailed information on Soviet losses in Afghanistan which has assisted the Russian Federation in reducing the number of official MIAs resulting from the Afghan conflict from 315 to 287. The U.S. side has also created an annotated computerized database for the Russian side with detailed information on each of the remaining 287 MIAs.

The Cold War Working Group has also addressed the Russian side's request for information on incidents involving Soviet servicemen missing from the Cold War era. The Department of Defense, Departments of Army, Navy, Air Force and the Marine Corps, the Joint Staff, the Department of State, the National Archives and intelligence organizations of the United States have engaged in a search of records and archives in order to be as responsive as possible to each Russian request. The U.S. has provided important information on certain of these incidents, including the return of ship's artifacts relating to the loss of the Soviet Golf-class submarine in 1968, reports, messages, deck logs and other documentation relating to Soviet aircraft lost on 4 September 1950, 18 November 1952 and 25 May 1968, as well as film footage documenting the 1968 crash. The U.S. side has provided a significant number of documents from the National Archives pertaining to the loss of a Soviet IL-12 on 27 July 1953. Information on seven Soviet advisors captured in the Ogaden in July 1978 has also been provided. Work relating to the fates of missing Russian servicemen continues on the U.S. side.

The Cold War Working Group has developed information of central importance to the work of the Commission and continues to pursue new avenues of inquiry. The working group is totally dedicated to the fullest possible accounting of all servicemen still unaccounted for from Cold War losses.

The current status of each aspect of the working group's investigations is reported as indicated below. The entire report of the Cold War Working Group with attachments has been provided to the National Archives and Records Administration and to the appropriate armed service casualty offices.

Cold War Incident	Page Nu	<u>mber</u>
8 April 1950 PB4Y2 Privateer incident		6
6 November 1951 P2V Neptune incident		13
13 June 1952 RB-29 incident		18
7 October 1952 RB-29 incident		26
29 July 1953 RB-50 incident		33
18 April 1955 RB-47 incident		42
10 September 1956 RB-50 incident		46
2 September 1958 C-130 incident		50
1 July 1960 RB-47 incident		56
14 December 1965 RB-57 incident		62
Soviet Missing in Action, Afghan conflict		67

5

Soviet Cold War losses	 71

#### U.S. NAVY PB4Y2 PRIVATEER - - 8 APRIL 1950 - - BALTIC SEA

# Introduction

Summary of Incident. On 8 April 1950, a PB4Y2 Privateer aircraft stationed at Port Lyautey, Morocco, serving on temporary duty in Wiesbaden, Germany, carrying a crew of ten, was shot down by Soviet fighter planes during the conduct of an operational mission over the Baltic Sea. American search and rescue efforts continued until 16 April but were unsuccessful. The only known eyewitnesses to the incident were the Soviet fighter pilots who shot down the plane. The entire crew is unaccounted for. A presumptive finding of death was issued by the U.S. Navy on 11 April 1951 (Tab A).

Personnel Involved. PB4Y2 crew

FETTE, John H., LT Unaccounted For

SEESCHAF, Howard W., LT

Unaccounted For

REYNOLDS, Robert D., LTJG Unaccounted For

BURGESS, Tommy L., ENS

Unaccounted For

BECKMAN, Frank L., AT1 Unaccounted For

DANENS, Joe H., AD1 Unaccounted For

THOMAS, Jack W., AD1 Unaccounted For

BOURASSA, Joseph Jay, AL3

Unaccounted For

PURCELL, Edward J., CT3

Unaccounted For

RINNIER, Joseph Norris Jr., AT3

Unaccounted For

*U.S. position*. The U.S. position prior to the establishment of the Joint Commission was that this plane had been on a routine flight when it was attacked by Soviet fighters and shot down over international waters. When the case was presented to the Russian side of the Commission in 1992, the U.S. side acknowledged that the plane had been on an intelligence gathering mission.

Russian position. At the time of the incident, the USSR insisted that the plane had violated the state border of the USSR, flying 21 kilometers inland over Soviet territory in the vicinity of Liepaya and then opening fire on Soviet fighters. The USSR maintained that the Soviet fighters had returned fire only after being shot at by the American plane, which had then turned towards the sea and disappeared. The USSR claimed that the American aircraft had been a B-29. There were no USAF B-29 aircraft in the vicinity of Liepaya on that day. During the work of the Commission, the Russian side has acknowledged from the beginning that the PB4Y2 was shot down by Soviet aircraft.

Work of the Commission. The U.S. side included the issue of the unaccounted-for crew from the 8 April 1950 shootdown at the Joint Commission's first formal session in Moscow, March 1992. As reviewed in the second through fifth sections, the Commission has researched archival records and interviewed participants and witnesses as part of the ongoing investigation into the fates of those unaccounted for. The current status of the Commission's work on this incident is presented in Current status.

#### Live sighting reports

None

#### Archival records

Russian. The Russian side has passed to the U.S. side diplomatic and military documents during the meetings of the Joint Commission. Soviet archival sources establish that Soviet fighters shot down the plane because the PB4Y2 violated Soviet airspace. Soviet fighters were scrambled from an airfield near Liepaya and intercepted the PB4Y2 south of Liepaya at the coastline. The Soviet documents state that the U.S. plane fired on the Soviet fighters first and that they were forced to return fire. Four Soviet fighters, flown by Senior Lieutenants Tezyaev, Gerasimov, Sataev, and Dokin from a Guards Aviation unit, engaged the PB4Y2. The Soviet documents report that the American plane sharply descended and entered the clouds on a course of 270° crashing into the sea 5-10 kilometers from the coastline. These actions occurred at 1739 hours local time.

During plenary sessions of the Joint Commission the Russians have passed the U.S. side documents which shed light on the air engagement and the Soviet search effort. These documents state that 45 Soviet vessels and 160 divers participated in the search but found no part of the plane and no survivors.

The holdings from Russian archives that have been provided to the U.S. side in the work of the Commission are as follows (included with translations at Tab B):

Handwritten reports of pilots Tezyaev, Gerasimov, Sataev and Dokin dated 8 April 1950

Handwritten report to Colonel Kovalenko dated 13 April 1950

Letter to Stalin and Bulganin from Yumashev dated 14 June 1950

Corrections made by Stalin to an article on the shootdown for publication in Pravda

*U.S.* This incident is heavily documented in U.S. files. The Commander in Chief of U.S. Naval Forces, Eastern Atlantic and Mediterranean ordered a special board convened at Port Lyautey to inquire into the circumstances surrounding the PB4Y2's loss. The Board of Investigation interviewed at least 17 individuals and examined hundreds of pages of documents. The United States made several formal diplomatic protests to the Soviet Union, although the case was never taken to the International Court of Justice. U.S. records indicate that the plane was shot down within a 50 mile radius centered at 56-19N 18-45E. This location was estimated by the Chief of Naval Operations based on current and wind information and the locations of debris picked up by search crews.

The PB4Y2 took off at 1031 Greenwich time from Wiesbaden, Germany. A radio transmission was received approximately two and one half hours later which stated that the plane had crossed the coastline of the British Zone of Germany. The plane was tracked between 1412Z hours and 1457Z hours by American radar. A projection of the flight plan indicates that at the time of the incident the plane should have been at approximately 53 30N 20 17E.

The American search and rescue effort started almost immediately after the plane was reported missing. American, British, and Swedish vessels searched until 16 April. Two life rafts were found that were tentatively identified as belonging to the lost aircraft. The nose wheel of the PB4Y2 was found on

25 April 1950 by Swedish fishermen. Seat cushions, radio logs, and other debris washed up on the coastline and were brought to U.S. authorities conducting the search. No survivors or remains were found.

An unconfirmed press report by an American news commentator on 30 April 1950 stated that the Soviets had succeeded in finding the sunken PB4Y2 and were attempting to salvage its electronic equipment.

Summary of U.S. holdings. Documents relating to this case found in U.S. holdings are as follows (included at Tab C):

# Crew List

Letter to Secretary of the Navy from Chief of Naval Operations	dated 14 April 1950
Telegram no.1143 to Secretary of State from Moscow	dated 15 April 1950
Press Releases of Diplomatic Notes	dated 18 April 1950
Foreign Service Dispatch to State Department from Helsinki	dated 21 April 1950
Telegram no. 1193 to Secretary of State from Moscow	dated 21 April 1950
Message to CNO from CINCNELM	undated
Naval Message from CINCNELM	dated 22 April 1950
Naval Message from American Embassy STOCKHOLM	dated 23 April 1950 1800 hrs
Telegram no. 526 to Secretary of State from Stockholm	dated 24 April 1950
Naval Message from CINCNELM	dated 25 April 1950
Telegram no. 537 to Secretary of State from Stockholm	dated 26 April 1950
Naval Message from VP 26	dated 26 April 1950
Telegram no. 542 to Secretary of State from Stockholm	dated 26 April 1950
Telegram no. 299 to Secretary of State from Copenhagen	dated 27 April 1950

Naval Message from CINCNELM	dated 29 April 1950
Naval Message from ALUSNA STOCKHOLM	dated 1 May 1950
Naval Message from CNO	dated 1 May 1950
Naval Message from CNO	dated 2 May 1950
Memorandum for Under Secretary of State	dated 2 May 1950
Intelligence Report 396-50	dated 2 May 1950
Naval Message from CINCNELM	dated 3 May 1950
Naval Message from ALUSNA COPENHAGEN	dated 3 May 1950
Naval Message from CINCNELM	dated 3 May 1950
Naval Message from CINCNELM	dated 4 May 1950
Naval Message from COMNAVFORGER, BERLIN	dated 5 May 1950
Confidential Memorandum for Op-03	dated 15 May 1950
Memorandum for Secretary of the Navy from Naval Intelligence	dated 24 May 1950
Memorandum for Record	dated 7 December 1951
Security Information	dated 25 January 1952
Security Information - Department of State	dated 28 January 1952
Note no. 79 from the Soviet Government	dated 13 August 1956
Memorandum of Conversation	dated 5 July 1955
Letter to the Honorable Alvin M. Bentley from Walter Stoessel	dated 29 December 1955
Excerpts from Foreign Relations	
Excerpt from Soviet Weekly	

#### Eyewitness accounts

The only known eyewitnesses to this incident are the four Soviet fighter pilots. The Russian side of the Commission has passed to the U.S. side the debriefings of the four Soviet fighter pilots, all of which confirm the facts of the case as maintained in the Soviet archival record. At the 9<sup>th</sup> Plenary of the Joint Commission Mr. Anatoliy Gerasimov, one of the Soviet pilots, was interviewed. Mr. Gerasimov stated that the plane was approximately 70 kilometers from the Russian coast when it was intercepted by Soviet fighters. On the approach of the Soviet planes Mr. Gerasimov indicated to the American plane that it was to fly towards land. The PB4Y2 attempted to fly out to sea. Mr. Gerasimov was ordered to fire warning shots at the American plane, which he did. The Soviet pilots were then given the command to fire on the plane. Mr. Gerasimov stated that his comrades opened fire and the plane "caught fire, exploded in the air, and fell in pieces into the sea". After circling the area a few times the Soviet fighters returned to base. Mr. Gerasimov's testimony accords with the facts as established by U.S. archival evidence. Mr. Gerasimov's full account is at Tab D.

On 2 September 1992, retired Soviet General Fyodor Shinkarenko was interviewed. General (ret.) Shinkarenko stated that he had heard from another Soviet citizen that the PB4Y2 had been salvaged and sent to Moscow. General Shinkarenko's full account is at Tab E.

An article printed in the Russian newspaper Izvestiya in the morning edition of 29 August 1992 stated that a letter had been received from a former Soviet sailor, Victor Shevchuk, who claimed to have participated in the search for the PB4Y2. Mr. Shevchuk remembered items from the plane being raised to the deck of the ship he served on, and heard from divers that the remains of the crew of the PB4Y2 was found in the cockpit of the plane. Efforts to locate and interview Mr. Shevchuk are currently underway.

#### Field investigations

None

#### Current status

As a result of the work thus far of the Joint Commission, the U.S. side has had the opportunity to examine the loss of the PB4Y2 in some detail. Archival data, eyewitness accounts, and the testimony of one of the Soviet pilots who shot down the plane have contributed to the information available to the Commission.

The Commission's efforts to develop information on the fates of those missing from this incident continue. Specific archival documentation related to this incident was identified in 1995 and requested from the Russian side. It has not yet been received. Additional witnesses to include participants in Soviet search and recovery operations are also being sought.

At the request of a family member, information on the crew was sent to five Russian psychiatric hospitals asking if members of the crew had ever been in these hospitals. Responses received to date have indicated no record of such individuals.

Paramount to the efforts of the Commission is the question of determining whether or not there were survivors. There are no references to survivors in any of the documentation presented thus far by either side, nor do any witnesses or participants interviewed thus far mention survivors. Work continues as identified above.

# <u>U.S. NAVY P2V - - 6 NOVEMBER 1951 - - SEA O</u>F JAPAN

# Introduction

Summary of Incident. On 6 November 1951 a P2V Neptune stationed at Atsugi Airfield, Japan, assigned to Fleet Air Wing Six, carrying a crew of ten, was shot down by Soviet fighter planes during a reconnaissance mission over the Sea of Japan. American search and rescue efforts were conducted through 9 November; they were unsuccessful. The only known eyewitnesses to this incident are the two Soviet pilots. The entire crew of the P2V is unaccounted for. A presumptive finding of death for the crew members was issued by the U.S. Navy on 7 November 1952 (Tab A).

Personnel Involved. P2V Crew

HODGSON, Judd C., LTJG Unaccounted For

ROSENFELD, Sam, LTJG Unaccounted For

SMITH, Donald E., ENS

Unaccounted For

BAGGETT, Reuben S., AO1 Unaccounted For

FOSTER, Paul R., AD1 Unaccounted For

RAGLIN, Erwin D., AT1 Unaccounted For

JURIC, Paul G., AL2

Unaccounted For

MEYER, William S., AT2

Unaccounted For

WIGERT, Ralph A. Jr., AL2

Unaccounted For

LIVELY, Jack, AD3 Unaccounted For

*U.S. position*. The U.S. position prior to the establishment of the Joint Commission was that this plane had been on a weather reconnaissance flight when it was shot down by Soviet fighters over international waters. When the case was presented to the Russian side of the Commission in 1992, the U.S. side acknowledged that the plane had been on an intelligence gathering mission.

Russian position. At the time of the incident, the USSR insisted that the plane had violated the state border of the Soviet Union in the vicinity of Cape Ostrovnoy. The USSR Foreign Ministry protested the alleged border violation to the U.S. Embassy in Moscow, and asserted that Soviet fighter planes had been forced to return fire when the P2V fired on them. During the work of the Commission, the Russian side has acknowledged from the beginning that the P2V was shot down by Soviet aircraft.

Work of the Commission. The U.S. side included the issue of the unaccounted-for crew from the 6 November 1951 shootdown as an agenda item at the Joint Commission's first formal session in Moscow in March 1992. To further the work of the Commission, the U.S. side presented a case study to the Russian side in 1993 (Tab B). As reviewed in the second through fifth sections, the Commission has researched archival records relating to the incident and carried out field investigations in the Soviet Far East. The current status of the Commission's work on this incident is presented in Current status.

# Live sighting reports

None

# Archival records

*Russian*. The Russian side has passed to the U.S. side diplomatic and military documents related to this incident during the meetings of the Joint Commission. These documents begin to clarify what happened to the P2V.

Soviet archival sources establish that Soviet fighters shot down the plane because the P2V violated Soviet airspace in the area of Cape Ostrovnoy approximately 7-8 miles from the shore. Soviet fighters were scrambled and intercepted the P2V south-west of Cape Ostrovnoy. Two Soviet LA-11 fighters, flown by Senior Lieutenants Lukashev and Shchukin from 5<sup>th</sup> Fleet Naval Aviation, engaged the P2V. The Soviet documents report that the American plane "fell, burning, into the water and exploded 18 miles from the shore". These actions occurred between 1010 and 1018 hours local time.

During plenary sessions of the Joint Commission, the Russians passed to the U.S. side documents addressing the air engagement and their search efforts. The holdings from Soviet archives

that have been provided to the U.S. side in the work of the Commission are as follows (included with translations at Tab C).

dated 6 November 1951

Letter to Stalin from Kuznetsov with enclosures

Journal of the Deputy Minister of Foreign Affairs on 7 November dated 7 November 1951

meeting with U.S. Charge d'Affaires

Letter to Stalin from Kuznetsov dated 7 November 1951

Central Committee Report, Demarche to U.S. Government dated 7 November 1951

Special Report from Deputy Chief, Border Guards' Headquarters dated 9 November 1951

Decree awarding Red Banner to pilots Lukashev and Shchukin dated 17 November 1951

U.S. This incident is also documented in U.S. files. The U.S. exchanged diplomatic notes with the USSR, made a protest to the United Nations, and considered requesting the Secretary General of the UN to make a claim against the USSR in the International Court of Justice. The American legal position was unclear because of the P2V's official status as part of UN forces. For this reason the claim was

The last communications check from the P2V was at 0646 hours. U.S. military authorities tracked the plane by radar from Hokkaido to latitude 42 39 North longitude 138 12 East at 0850 hours. A routine report which should have been transmitted at approximately 0945 was not received. No signals were heard from the plane indicating an attack or reporting the approach of Soviet fighters.

The American search and rescue effort started almost immediately. Aircraft from the Sixth Fleet Air Wing and search and rescue units from the Atsugi area participated. The search continued until 9 November 1951 but no debris or survivors were found.

Summary of U.S. holdings. Documents relating to this case found in U.S. holdings are as follows (included at Tab D).

Crew List

not pursued further.

Report on Circumstances Attending the Disappearance	dated 11 November 1951
of P2V-3W	
Message traffic to CINCUNC JAPAN from SECDEF	dated 8 November 1951
Memorandum to JCS from Chief of Naval Operations	dated 9 November 1951
Security Information for OSD from CINCUNC TOKYO JAPAN	dated 10 November 1951
State Department telegram to American Embassy Moscow	dated 13 November 1951
	6:08 p.m.
War Diary of Commander, Fleet Air Wing Six	
War Diary of Commander, Fleet Air Wing Six  Request for Information to CG FEAF Japan and COMNAVFE	dated 14 November 1951
•	dated 14 November 1951 dated 3 December 1951
Request for Information to CG FEAF Japan and COMNAVFE	
Request for Information to CG FEAF Japan and COMNAVFE  Department of State Bulletin	dated 3 December 1951
Request for Information to CG FEAF Japan and COMNAVFE  Department of State Bulletin  Letter to MG Samford from James Walsh	dated 3 December 1951 dated 3 December 1951

# Eyewitness accounts

The Soviet fighter pilots involved have not been located. Efforts to locate and interview them continue.

# Field investigations

Several trips have been made to the Russian Far East to search for information regarding this incident. Two former Soviet prison camps, Magadan and Susuman, have been visited and their card files searched for mention of names of American personnel.

In March 1995, representatives of the Joint Commission visited Vladivostok in an attempt to locate eyewitnesses and confirm archival data pertaining to the loss of the P2V. In response to an

appeal for information published in a local newspaper, Mr. Vladimir Trotsenko contacted Commission representatives and stated that in late October or early November 1951, while in a military hospital in the town of Novosysoyevka in the Soviet Far East, he saw four American servicemen who were being treated for injuries. He also said he had been shown a grave in the hospital cemetery in which a fifth American was buried. A field investigation with the participation of CILHI specialists was conducted in October 1995. No American remains were discovered.

#### Current status

As a result of the work of the Joint Commission, the U.S. side has had the opportunity to examine the loss of the P2V in some detail. Archival data and field investigation have contributed to the information available to the Commission.

Efforts to locate witnesses to this incident who might clarify the fate of those unaccounted for from the crew of the P2V continue. To date, as stated above, neither of the two Soviet pilots involved in this incident has been located. Finding and interviewing these pilots remains a priority in the investigation of this incident. Additional documentation on this incident is also being sought, to include reports on the debriefing of the pilots and reports from the Border Guards detachment nearest the location of the incident.

Paramount in the efforts of the Commission is the question of survivors. There are no references to survivors in archival evidence from either side. The possibility that the testimony of Mr. Trotsenko, repeated in detail at the 12<sup>th</sup> Plenary Session of the Joint Commission in August 1995, relates to this incident is being thoroughly researched. During the Plenary Session, the Russian side of the Commission stated that archival records indicated that Mr. Trotsenko was a patient in the hospital from March through May 1951. Following the 12<sup>th</sup> Plenary Session the Russian side provided three documents identifying the period March-May 1951 as the time of Trotsenko's hospitalization. The U.S. side continues to follow up on his testimony. Additional archival research and efforts to locate additional witnesses are currently underway.

# <u>U.S. AIR FORCE RB-29 - - 13 JUNE 1952 - - SEA OF JAPAN</u>

# Introduction

Summary of Incident. On 13 June 1952, an RB-29 aircraft stationed at Yokota Air Force Base, Japan, assigned to the 91<sup>st</sup> Strategic Reconnaissance Squadron, carrying a crew of twelve, was shot down by Soviet fighter planes during the conduct of a reconnaissance mission over the Sea of Japan.

American search and rescue efforts were conducted from 14 June until 17 June. On 14 June one of the search planes sighted and photographed an empty life raft. Search planes remained in the area until darkness but were unable to salvage the raft due to prevailing conditions. An unconfirmed report indicated that a second life raft was seen four miles south of the first raft. This report could not be verified. The search resumed on 15 June but neither life raft was seen. The search continued until 17 June 1952. Contemporary American documents report that neither survivors nor wreckage were seen during the search operations. One contemporary Soviet document also notes that no wreckage of the aircraft, pieces of equipment or members of the crew were found. The documentary record of this case is provided in the Archival records section.

In March 1995, during interviews conducted as part of the Commission's investigation of this incident, two American participants in the search and rescue operations reported having seen the RB-29 intact and floating on the water. Their statements are further detailed in the Eyewitness accounts section.

The entire crew of the RB-29 remains unaccounted for. A presumptive finding of death was issued by the Air Force on 14 November 1955 (Tab A).

Personnel Involved. RB-29 crew

BUSCH, Samuel N., MAJ Unaccounted For

SCULLEY, James A., CAPT Unaccounted For

SERVICE, Samuel D., CAPT Unaccounted For

Unaccounted For

HOMER, William R., MSGT Unaccounted For

MOORE, David L., MSGT Unaccounted For

BLIZZARD, William A., SSGT Unaccounted For

MONSERRAT, Miguel W., SSGT Unaccounted For

BONURA, Leon F., SSGT Unaccounted For

BECKER, Roscoe G., SSGT Unaccounted For

BERG, Eddie R., SSGT Unaccounted For

PILLSBURY, Danny H., A1C Unaccounted For

*U.S. position*. The U.S. position prior to the establishment of the Joint Commission was that the plane had disappeared during a routine flight over the Sea of Japan. During the work of the Commission, the U.S. side acknowledged that the plane had been on a reconnaissance mission.

Russian position. At the time of the incident the USSR denied any knowledge of the reason for the plane's disappearance or of the fate of the crew. Following presentation of the case to the Russian side of the Commission, the Russian side provided documents which confirmed that the plane had been shot down by Soviet fighters.

Work of the Commission. The U.S. side included the issue of the unaccounted-for crew from the 13 June 1952 incident at the Joint Commission's first formal session in Moscow in March 1992. To further the work of the Commission, the U.S. side presented a case study to the Russian side in 1993 (Tab B). As reviewed in the second through fifth sections, the Commission has researched archival records relating to the incident, interviewed U.S. search crew members, and conducted field investigations in Magadan and Vladivostok. The Commission's work is presented in the Current status section.

# Live sighting reports

None

# Archival records:

*Russian*. The Russian side has passed to the U.S. side diplomatic and military documents related to this incident during the meetings of the Joint Commission. These documents begin to clarify events surrounding the downing of the RB-29.

Soviet archival documents report that Soviet fighters shot down the plane because the RB-29 violated Soviet airspace in the area of Valentin Bay, nine miles from the Soviet coastline. The Soviet documents state that the U.S. plane fired on the Soviet fighters first and that they were forced to return fire. Two MIG-15 fighters, flown by Captains Fedotov and Proskurin, engaged the RB-29. The Soviet documents report that the U.S. plane then "descended to an altitude of 10-15 meters at 1739 hrs, burst into flames and crashed into the water at a distance of about 18 miles from our coastline".

The three contemporary documents relating to this incident which have been provided by the Russian side to date also shed light on the air engagement and on Soviet knowledge of U.S. search efforts. The 13 June 1952 report from Kuznetsov to Stalin states that the shootdown was recorded on film. The U.S. side has formally requested any photography from the incident. The Russian side has formally stated that the photography cannot be found and that it no longer exists.

In a report to the Deputy Minister of Foreign Affairs, Comrade Zorin, the Soviet Deputy Minister of State Security reported that no wreckage of the aircraft, pieces of equipment or crew members were found by the coast guard or the shore patrol.

Additional documents being sought by the U.S. side which might pertain to the incident include possible debriefing reports from the two Soviet pilots who are now both deceased (see Current status section), a report made by the Commander of the 5<sup>th</sup> Fleet, reports on search and rescue efforts by Soviet forces, and information pertaining to a radio broadcast picked up at Yokota Air Force Base which claimed that a U.S. airman had been picked up from a downed aircraft (see Tab A, paragraph 4.b.).

The holdings from Russian archives that have been provided to the U.S. side in the work of the Commission are as follows (included with translations at Tab C):

1. Letter to Stalin from Kuznetsov, w/map

dated 13 June 1952

2. Letter to Stalin from Kuznetsov

dated 14 June 1952

3. Letter to Deputy Minister of Foreign Affairs from Stakhanov

dated 25 June 1952

4. Excerpt from Deciphered telegram No.503826/sh to 8<sup>th</sup>

dated 26 November 1952

Directorate, Soviet General Staff

5. Russian newspaper articles in translation "May I Not See the

Statue of Liberty for as Long as I Live" 11 June 1992,

Komsomolskaya Pravda, by K. Belyaninov. "Where did 20,000

Americans Disappear to?" 1 August 1991, Nezavisimaya Gazeta,

by Vadim Birshteyn.

*U.S.* The U.S. side has established documentation of this incident in U.S. files as follows. The U.S. did not present a formal diplomatic claim against the USSR to the International Court of Justice because of a lack of hard evidence at the time that the plane had been shot down. The U.S. issued one note, no.689 of June 18, 1952, requesting that the USSR investigate the disappearance of a B-29 aircraft during a routine flight over the Sea of Japan. On 16 June 1956 the U.S. claimed that the Soviet Union was aware of U.S. servicemen being held on Soviet territory, specifically mentioning the crew of the RB-29. This note was based on various source reports that American servicemen had been seen in prison camps on Soviet territory. These reports remain unsubstantiated, and no definitive evidence has been located to date on the fates of the twelve unaccounted-for crew members.

The U.S. documents indicate that on 13 June 1952, U.S. military authorities tracked the RB-29 by radar until 1320 hours, at which time it left the radar zone over the Sea of Japan, approximately 100 miles northwest of Hokkaido at a point 120 miles from the Russian coast. The last radio contact with the plane was a routine "coast-out" transmission at 1027 hours.

The American search and rescue effort started on the morning of 14 June and continued until 17 June. A total of 10 aircraft from the 91<sup>st</sup> Reconnaissance Squadron, the 345<sup>th</sup> Bomber Squadron, and Air Sea Rescue units participated in an intensive search of the proposed route and adjacent areas.

On 14 June one of the search planes sighted and photographed an empty life raft, which was right side up, at a location approximately 100 miles off the Russian coast. Aircraft remained in the area until nightfall when they returned to base. On 15 June aircraft dispatched to recover the raft were unable to relocate it.

A report indicating that on 14 June another search plane sighted an overturned life raft about four miles south of the first raft could not be verified. No photographs were taken of this second raft, nor was it recovered.

In an Air Force report titled, "Continuance of Missing Status Beyond Twelve Months" and dated 4 Jun 1953, the results of the search and rescue operations conducted from 14-17 June were summarized; "... no wreckage was found, nor was there any sign of survivors."

Summary of U.S. holdings. Documents related to this case found in U.S. holdings are as follows (Tab D):

USAF Continuance of Missing status for case # 418	dated 4 June 1953
Telegram to Moscow from State Department	dated 17 June 1952
Telegram to Secretary of State from Moscow	dated 18 June 1952
Telegram to Secretary of State from Moscow	dated 24 June 1952
Telegram to Secretary of State from Moscow	dated 15 July 1952
Message to American Embassy MOSCOW	
New York Times Article	dated 17 July 1956
Excerpts from State Department Bulletin	dated 30 July 1956
Excerpts from the History of 91 <sup>st</sup> Strategic Reconnaissance Squadron	dated 26 January 1956
10. Letter from William E. Koski to Air Force Casualty Office	
Casualty Questionnaire of Francis A. Strieby	date unknown

Eyewitness accounts

Captains Fedotov and Proskurin, the Soviet pilots who shot down the RB-29, are deceased. No Russian eyewitnesses to the incident or participants in the subsequent search and rescue operations have been identified by the Joint Commission.

During the work of the Commission, former crew members of American planes which participated in the search for the RB-29 and its crew have been interviewed. Two members of a search crew from the 345<sup>th</sup> Bomber Squadron at Yokota Air Force Base stated, during interviews conducted in March 1995, that they sighted the RB-29 aircraft floating in the water about twenty-five miles off the Russian coast. (Reports on these interviews are contained at Tab E). According to the two crew members' reports, the aircraft was floating on the water, undamaged and intact. One crew member recalled that both life raft compartments were open and at least one life raft was missing. As a result of communication problems the aircraft commander did not realize the plane had been spotted until about 15 minutes later. Efforts at that time to relocate the plane were not successful. Because the RB-29 had not been relocated and because none of the search plane's officers had seen the plane, the two crew members made no mention of the sighting in the debriefing which followed completion of the search mission.

No information on possible survivors to the incident was received from interviews with American search crew members. Information gained from a related incident indicates that captured members of the crew of an B-29 shot down on 4 July 1952 over North Korea were interrogated, in North Korea and China, and were specifically asked about Major Busch, the aircraft commander of the RB-29 shot down on 13 June 1952.

Following their return to the United States after being held prisoner, two of the crew members from the 4 July 1952 shootdown reported that they had been asked about Major Busch during interrogation. (Documents included at Tab D.) One crew member stated in a 1956 statement that the questioning on Major Busch was very intense and that questions on Major Busch's personality, past history and previous service were asked. This crew member's statements were confirmed in a follow-up interview conducted recently by the Commission's support staff.

A document provided by the Russian side of the Commission in the Korean War Working Group also indicates that information on Major Busch was elicited during the interrogations of the crew of the B-29 downed on 4 July 1952 (Tab C). The Russian side believes there were no survivors in the shootdown of the RB-29, and suggests the interrogators may have learned of the crew names through signals or communications intercepts. Neither side of the Commission has been able to clarify the circumstances surrounding the interrogation about Major Busch. This issue remains unanswered and open to further research.

#### Field investigations

Representatives of the Joint Commission have made several trips to the Russian Far East in an effort to ascertain the fate of the crew of the RB-29. Two former Soviet prison camps, Magadan and Susuman, have been visited and a trip was made to Vladivostok in March 1995 to attempt to locate eyewitnesses and confirm archival evidence.

#### Current status

As a result of the work of the Joint Commission the U.S. side has had the opportunity to examine the loss of the RB-29 in detail. Archival data and interviews of search and rescue personnel have contributed to the information available to the Commission.

Efforts are currently underway to locate additional records of the incident in both U.S. and Russian archives, to clarify the significance of the radio message heard on 14 June 1952, and to complete the record by interviewing any additional personnel who have knowledge pertaining to this incident. While both Soviet pilots who participated in the shootdown are now deceased, the U.S. side has asked the Russian side to help locate squadron mates of the pilots who might have authoritative knowledge of the incident. Two newspaper articles citing a variety of witnesses and documentary sources have appeared in the Russian press. (English translations are included at Tab C.) These articles raise a number of questions related to the incident. The Commission continues efforts to locate and interview the journalists who wrote the articles in an effort to identify additional concrete sources of information.

Paramount in the efforts of the Commission is the question of survivors. Thus far, the work of the Commission has produced the 25 June 1952 letter from Stakhanov to the Deputy Minister of Foreign Affairs stating that no wreckage of the aircraft, pieces of equipment or crew members were found by the coast guard or the shore patrol. The U.S. side continues to press for more detailed, unit-level information from the Border Guards. Additionally, the Commission continues efforts to follow up on the documents at Tab C addressing the interrogation of the crew of the RB-29 shot down on 4 July 1952, to include specific questions about Major Busch. The Commission is still trying to establish why these questions would have been asked.

# U.S. AIR FORCE RB-29 - - 7 OCTOBER 1952 - - NORTHERN PACIFIC

# Introduction

Summary of Incident. On 7 October 1952, an RB-29 aircraft stationed at Yokota Air Force Base, Japan, assigned to the 91<sup>st</sup> Strategic Reconnaissance Squadron, carrying a crew of eight, was shot down by Soviet fighter planes during the conduct of a reconnaissance mission north of the island of Hokkaido. American search and rescue efforts continued through 12 October, but were unsuccessful due primarily to bad weather. However, there were many eyewitnesses to the incident, mostly Japanese fishermen. Soviet search and rescue units recovered the body of one U.S. crewman, John R. Dunham. His remains were transported to Yuri Island in the Kurile chain, where he was buried. As a direct result of the work of the Commission, his remains have been recovered. The remainder of the crew is still unaccounted for. A presumptive finding of death for the crew was issued by the Air Force on 15 November 1955. The 30 November 1955 casualty report for Captain John Robertson Dunham with its 15 November 1955 presumptive finding of death is included at Tab A.

Personnel Involved. RB-29 crew

KENDRICK, Fred G., E-2

DUNHAM, John R., CAPT	Remains Recovered

ENGLISH, Eugene M., CAPT Unaccounted For

BROCK, Paul E., 1LT Unaccounted For

COLGAN, Sam A., E-6 Unaccounted For

NEAIL, Frank E. III, E-2

Unaccounted For

SHIPP, Thomas G., E-1 Unaccounted For

*U.S. position*. The U.S. position prior to the establishment of the Joint Commission was that this plane had been on a routine operational flight when it was attacked by Soviet fighters and shot down over

Unaccounted For

Unaccounted For

international waters. When the case was presented to the Russian side of the Commission in 1992, the U.S. side acknowledged that the plane had been on an intelligence gathering mission.

Russian position. At the time of the incident, the USSR insisted that the plane had violated the state border of the Soviet Union in the vicinity of Yuri Island. The USSR Foreign Ministry protested the alleged border violation to the U.S. Embassy in Moscow, and asserted that Soviet forces had been justified in shooting down the RB-29. During the work of the Commission, the Russian side has acknowledged from the beginning that the RB-29 was shot down by Soviet aircraft.

Work of the Commission. The U.S. side included the issue of the unaccounted-for crew from the 7 October 1952 shootdown as an agenda item at the Joint Commission's first formal session in Moscow, March 1992. To further the work of the Commission, the U.S. side presented a case study to the Russian side in 1993 (Tab B). As reviewed in the second through fifth sections, the Commission has researched archival records relating to the incident, interviewed participants and witnesses and carried out two field investigations on Yuri Island. The current status of the Commission's work on this incident is presented in Current status.

#### Live sighting reports

None

# Archival records

*Russian*. The Russian side has passed to the U.S. side diplomatic and military documents during the meetings of the Joint Commission. These documents provide a detailed account of what happened to the RB-29.

Soviet archival sources establish that Soviet fighters shot down the plane because the RB-29 violated Soviet airspace three times over the southern Kuriles. The first and second alleged violations were for a total of eight or nine minutes over Tanfilev Island, the third over water at latitude 43°, 18' North, longitude 145° 59' East. Soviet fighters were scrambled from South Sakhalin airfield, and intercepted the RB-29 south of Demin Island. The Soviet documents state that the U.S. plane fired on the Soviet fighters first and that they were forced to return fire. Two Soviet LA-11 fighters, flown by

Senior Lieutenants Zhiryakov and Lesnov from the 368<sup>th</sup> Air Defense Fighter Aviation Regiment, engaged the RB-29. The Soviet documents report that the American plane then lost altitude and "went off into the direction of the sea." These actions occurred between 1400 and 1535 Khabarovsk time (which is one hour later than the Japanese local time).

During plenary sessions of the Joint Commission the Russians passed the U.S. side documents which shed light on the air engagement and their search efforts. One of the first documents received by the U.S. side of the Commission on this incident was a report to Stalin detailing the crash at sea and the recovery of a body. A handwritten log of the 114<sup>th</sup> Border Guard detachment indicates that the RB-29 crashed 1.5 KM southwest of Demin Island, and goes on,"the aircraft was in flames as it fell, upon striking the water there were two strong explosions... During examination of the crash site by border troops, the 114<sup>th</sup> Border Detachment picked up a pilot's headless body... The body was in a black flight suit with the name of Dunkkhen Dzhon Robertson, service # 2073A." Documents which detail the Soviet Board of Inquiry, carried out later in October 1952, were passed to the U.S. side in September 1993, along with a map indicating the flight path of the RB-29. The Russian side of the Commission passed the U.S. side a document in March 1994 that detailed the location of Dunham's burial site on Yuri Island. It was signed by three Soviet officers who attested to the burial.

The holdings from Russian archives that have been provided to the U.S. side in the work of the Commission are as follows (included with translations at Tab C):

1.	Logs (Handwritten) of 114 <sup>th</sup> Border Guard Detachment	dated 7 October 1952
2.	Message to Stalin from Sokolovskiy and Vasilevskiy	dated 8 October 1952
3.	Certificate of Burial w/chart	dated 10 October 1952
4.	Excerpts of Report by Makhun on the incident w/map	dated 26 October 1952
5.	Report to Bulganin from Mikhajlov on Violations of Soviet Air	dated 19 December 1952
	Space	
6.	Letter to Comrade Malik from Comrade Bazikin	dated 22 January 1953

7. Letter to Molotov from Secretary TsK KPSS

dated 4 August 1953

8. Letter to TsK KPSS from Molotov

dated 29 December 1954

9. Letter to Molotov from Secretary TsK KPSS w/draft

dated 31 December 1954

*U.S.* This incident is heavily documented in U.S. files. The U.S. presented a formal diplomatic claim against the USSR in September 1954 for \$1.6 million for loss of the plane and crew, and took the case to the International Court of Justice in May 1955. The American legal position centered on questions of sovereignty over the Kuriles and nearby islands. U.S. records indicate that Soviet fighters shot down the RB-29 in the vicinity of Demin Island at around 1430 local on 7 October 1952 at approximately 43° 24' North, 146°, 6' East.

U.S. military authorities were tracking the RB-29 at the Air Defense Center in Nagoya, Japan. They saw the radar trace of the American plane merge with the track of an unidentified plane. The RB-29 had time to broadcast, "Mayday, let's get the hell out of here," before it went down. All military authorities interviewed by U.S. investigators shortly after the incident insisted that the RB-29 was on the U.S. side of the so-called MacArthur line, the dividing line between Soviet and American zones of occupation in post-war Japan.

The American SAR effort started immediately. Fighters from Chitose AB, and planes from the 3<sup>rd</sup> Air Rescue Group engaged in a search of the general crash area until 12 October 52. This effort was hampered greatly by bad weather. The Navy vessel referenced in U.S. documents as "Falcon Victor" also searched the crash area. No debris or survivors were found.

Summary of U.S. holdings. Documents related to this case found in U.S. holdings are as follows (at Tab D):

Chronology of incident

Combat Operations Division Daily Diary

dated 7 October 1952

Japan Air Defense Force History with list of supporting documents

Security Information dated 8 October 1952

w/correction of 10 October

1952

Soviet note dated 12 October 1952

Department of State Bulletin: Soviet note of 12 October 1952

Department of State Bulletin: U.S. reply of 17 October 1952

Telegram to Department of State from the Charge D'Affaires dated 17 October 1952

Press Release No. 816

Department of State Bulletin: Soviet note of 24 November 1953

Department of State Bulletin: U.S. note of 16 December 1953

#### Eyewitness accounts

There is much eyewitness evidence in U.S. archival material. The U.S. side interviewed numerous (at least 51) Japanese fishermen who were in the area on 7 October 1952, some in Soviet custody on Yuri Island. None of the interviewees saw the attack, but all saw the plane at some point during its flight. The eyewitnesses all tell much the same story: the RB-29 was flying in the vicinity of the Kurile/Habomai Islands on the afternoon of 7 October 1952 when fighters appeared and shot the plane down. It went down trailing thick black smoke.

At the 7<sup>th</sup> Plenary session of the Commission in December, 1993, former Soviet KGB Maritime Border Guards sailor Vasili Saiko came forward. Saiko had served in the Maritime Border Guards on a cutter in the Yuri Island region. On 7 October 1952, he and his mates watched the shootdown of the RB-29 from their ship, and were then tasked to sail to the crash site to recover survivors/plane parts. Saiko himself pulled Captain Dunham's body out of the water. On the evening of 7 October, while the cutter was en route to Yuri Island, Saiko took from one of Dunham's fingers his Naval Academy class ring. Saiko first showed the ring to the U.S. Co-Chairman of the Cold War Working Group and then presented the ring to Ambassador Toon at a press conference, and asked that the ring be presented to

Dunham's widow. This was done in a Pentagon ceremony on 16 December 1993. Saiko said that there were no survivors and no other remains at the crash site. Saiko's full account is at Tab E.

On 22 June 1994, U.S. interviewers met with retired Colonel Boris Alekseyevich Zhiryakov in Yevpatoriya, Ukraine. In 1952, he served as the Deputy Commander of the 368<sup>th</sup> Fighter Air Regiment. He stated that he was the pilot who shot down the RB-29 on 7 October 1952. He described how he warned the plane and tried to get it to land. When his warnings were ignored, he fired at it. The plane blew up in the air at 5000 meters, with the wings separating from the fuselage before it crashed into the sea near the shore. He stated emphatically and unequivocally that no air crewman could have survived the shootdown. A report on the interview with Zhiryakov and a transcript from a follow-on interview are at Tab F.

# Field investigations

In May 1994, a joint U.S.-Russian team went to Yuri Island to attempt to find Captain Dunham's remains. This first try was unsuccessful. In August/September 1994 a second expedition found and repatriated the remains of Captain Dunham. Full accounts of both trips are at Tab G.

#### Current status

As a result of the work of the Joint Commission, the U.S. side has had the opportunity to examine the loss of the RB-29 in detail. Archival data, eyewitness accounts, and the testimony of two former Soviet military personnel - one who shot down the plane, the other who recovered Captain Dunham's body from the Pacific Ocean - have contributed to the information available to the Commission.

Paramount in the efforts of the Commission is the question of survivors. Besides Captain Dunham, there were seven other crewmen on board the aircraft. At the 11<sup>th</sup> Plenary session in December 1994, new information from an interview with former Soviet Captain Panov was presented. Captain Panov stated that he was serving at a command post on Kunashir Island at the time of the incident and had heard that an American aviator was picked up by a Soviet cutter. There are no other

references to survivors in any of the documentation on either side, nor do any witnesses or participants mention the possibility of survivors.

Captain Panov also stated that he had been told by Lieutenant Zhiryakov that two parachutes were seen during this shootdown incident. During a follow-up interview, Colonel (Ret.) Zhiryakov disavowed any such statements. A report in the combat log of the USAF 39<sup>th</sup> Air Division asserts that the Japanese National Police had received reports of two parachutes sighted shortly after the attack. However, it was later reported by USAF tracking station #26 at Nemuro Point that the sighting had been erroneous. At this point in the work of the Commission, new leads for further inquiry have not yet been developed.

<u>U.S. AIR FORCE RB-50- - 29 JULY 1953 - - SEA OF JAPAN</u>

**Introduction** 

Summary of Incident. On 29 July 1953 an RB-50 aircraft stationed at Yokota Air Force Base, Japan,

carrying a crew of seventeen, was shot down by Soviet fighter planes during the conduct of a

reconnaissance mission over the Sea of Japan. From 29 July until 31 July search and rescue efforts

along the planned flight path of the missing aircraft were conducted by U.S. Navy surface vessels and

planes from the U.S. Air Force. On 30 July, the RB-50's co-pilot, Captain John E. Roche, the lone

occupant of a life raft which had been dropped on 29 July, was rescued by the USS Picking.

Crew members from U.S. search and rescue planes reported dropping a life boat to four

survivors in the vicinity of the area where Captain Roche was rescued. They also thought they had seen

three additional survivors about one mile away. Deteriorating weather conditions precluded positive

confirmation of these sightings.

The scope of Soviet search and rescue operations remains unclear. Participants in the U.S.

search and rescue operations reported seeing between nine and twelve Soviet "PT" type boats during

their search and that at least six of these boats were heading in the direction of the crash. U.S.

communications intercept reports also place Soviet ships in the area at the time of the incident. On the

Russian side, a contemporary Soviet document states that with the exception of one trawler, no other

Soviet ships were in the area. However, the Russian co-Chairman of the Commission has said there

were Soviet patrol boats in the area, although their logs have not been found.

The remains of two crew members, Captain Stanley O'Kelley and Master Sergeant Francis

Brown, were later recovered along the coast of Japan. First Lieutenant James Keith is presumed dead

based on information provided by Captain Roche. The remainder of the crew is unaccounted for. A

presumptive finding of death was issued by the Air Force on 14 November 1955. (At Tab A)

Personnel Involved. RB-50 crew

ROCHE, John E., CAPT

Rescued

34

O'KELLEY, Stanley K., CAPT	Remains Recovered
BROWN, Francis L., MSGT	Remains Recovered
KEITH, James G., CAPT	Presumed Dead
TEJEDA, Francisco J., MAJ	Unaccounted For
	Unaccounted For
SANDERSON, Warren J., CAPT	Unaccounted For
STALNAKER, Robert E., CAPT	Unaccounted For
	Unaccounted For
WIGGINS, Lloyd C., CAPT	Unaccounted For
	Unaccounted For
	Unaccounted For
	Unaccounted For
GOULET, Roland E., A1C	Unaccounted For
RADLEIN, Earl W. Jr., A2C	Unaccounted For
RUSSELL, Charles J. Jr., A2C	Unaccounted For
WOODS, James E., A2C	Unaccounted For

*U.S. position*. The U.S. position prior to the establishment of the Joint Commission was that this plane had been on a routine navigational training flight when it was attacked by Soviet fighters approximately 40 miles off the Russian coast. When the case was presented to the Russian side of the Commission in 1992 the U.S. side acknowledged that the plane had been on a reconnaissance mission.

In diplomatic correspondence and high-level meetings following the incident, the U.S. Government repeatedly raised the question of additional survivors with the Soviet Government. Within

the U.S. Government at the time of the incident there was a strong belief that the Soviets had picked up survivors of the crash.

Russian position. At the time of the incident the USSR insisted that the plane had violated Soviet territorial waters off Cape Povorotny. The USSR Foreign Ministry protested this alleged border violation to the U.S. Embassy in Moscow, stating that the RB-50 had fired first and the Soviet fighters had been forced to return fire. During the work of the Commission the Russian side has acknowledged from the beginning that the RB-50 was shot down by Soviet aircraft.

Throughout the diplomatic activity which followed the incident, the Soviet Government repeatedly stated that it had no information whatsoever concerning the plane or any member of its crew and that, according to verified information, the plane was last seen headed out to sea.

Work of the Commission. The U.S. side included the issue of the unaccounted-for crewmen from the 29 July 1953 shootdown as an agenda item at the Joint Commission's first formal session in Moscow in March 1992. To further the work of the Commission the U.S. side presented a case study to the Russian side in 1993 (Tab B). As reviewed in the second through fifth sections, the Commission has continued to pursue this case with great dedication, researching archival records relating to the incident, interviewing participants and witnesses and visiting sites in the former Soviet Union.

At the 10<sup>th</sup> Plenary Session of the U.S.-Russia Joint Commission held in Moscow in September 1994, General Volkogonov, the Russian co-Chairman of the Commission, described the 29 July 1953 incident as a "very puzzling case." He further suggested that pieces of the puzzle have yet to be found and that work remains to be done on this case and must continue. General Volkogonov concluded his remarks on the RB-50 shootdown by stating, "The case remains an historic mystery." Interviewed about the case in a 1994 BBC TV documentary, Spies in the Sky, General Volkogonov said, "There were boats in the area. We can't find the logs. This, too, makes me suspicious." The current status of the Commission's work on this incident is presented in Current status.

# Live sighting reports

None

#### Archival records

*Russian*. During meetings of the Joint Commission, the Russian side has passed to the U.S. side diplomatic and military documents related to this incident. These documents detail the Soviet version of what happened to the RB-50.

Soviet archival sources establish that Soviet fighters shot down the plane because the RB-50 violated Soviet airspace in the vicinity of Cape Gamov and Vladivostok. Soviet fighters were scrambled from Nikolaevka airfield and intercepted the RB-50 fifteen kilometers to the south of Askol'd Island. These documents state that the U.S. plane fired on the Soviet fighters first and that they were forced to return fire. Two Soviet MIG-17 fighters, flown by Captain Rybakov and Senior Lieutenant Yablonovsky from Pacific Fleet Naval Aviation, engaged the RB-50. The Soviet documents report that the American plane "while breaking into pieces, fell in flames into the water 15 km (8 miles) to the south of Askol'd Island". These actions occurred between 0700 and 0730 hours Vladivostok time.

Documents indicate that the Soviets were fully aware, through radio-intercept reports, of the nature and scope of American search and rescue efforts and of the successful rescue of Captain John Roche. Photographs of charts located at the Russian Naval Archives in Gatchina taken by the Commission depict in detail the flight pattern of the RB-50 and the Soviet interceptors and the names, types and locations of U.S. naval vessels involved in the subsequent search. One Soviet vessel, labeled SRT-423 (SRT - medium fishing trawler) is depicted on the chart. In a letter to Defense Minister Bulganin, Fleet Admiral Kuznetsov detailed the American search operations and stated that Trawler #423 was approached by two American destroyers in an attempt to get information regarding the B-50. No interpreter was available to either side and no information was exchanged. Another contemporary Soviet document maintains that the Soviets had no ships in the area of the crash besides trawler #423, which left the area and docked at the port of Nakhodka.

A list of the documents from Russian archives that have been provided to the U.S. side in the work of the Commission is included at Tab C. The documents are appended to this report with English translations at Appendix 1.

*U.S.* This incident is heavily documented in U.S. files. Archival holdings include demarches to the USSR, military reporting on the incident and the subsequent search and rescue operations, diplomatic records of high-level meetings and correspondence with Soviet officials, and affidavits and statements collected by U.S. legal representatives. U.S. records indicate that Soviet fighters shot down the RB-50 forty miles from the Siberian coast at approximately 4215N 13245E at 0615 on 29 July 1953.

U.S. military authorities tracked the RB-50 during the course of its flight. They saw the radar trace of the American plane merge with the track of an unidentified plane. Five additional plots were reported in the ten minutes after the two radar traces merged. It is unclear whether this tracking reflected the RB-50 taking evasive action or whether the plots reflected the interceptor aircraft after the interception occurred.

The American search and rescue effort started almost immediately. Two B-29's were dispatched to the area where radar had last tracked the RB-50. A document summarizing the debriefings of two search and rescue aircraft crews states that a life boat was dropped to four survivors at approximately 4214N 13259E. Scanners reported sighting what they thought were three additional survivors approximately one mile away in an oil slick. Fog and haze precluded positive observation. The mission report on the search and rescue operations conducted by the 37<sup>th</sup> Air rescue Squadron is included among the U.S. documentation on the case.

One U.S. heavy cruiser, four U.S. destroyers and one Australian destroyer were dispatched to the area at 1518 hours on 29 July, arriving at the rescue area at 2326 hours on 29 July. At 0419 hours on 30 July the destroyer USS Picking recovered Captain Roche in the vicinity of 4221N 13244E. No other survivors were found.

U.S. search and rescue reports and communications intercept reports indicate that between nine and twelve Soviet ships to include destroyers, submarines, minelayers, three unidentified minesweepers,

three subchasers, and smaller surface craft were tracked in the area of the crash on 30 July. U.S. reports do not indicate whether any Soviet vessels or aircraft made visual contact with U.S. search planes or ships.

Efforts by the U.S. Government to determine the extent of Soviet knowledge regarding the incident and, in particular, the question of survivors are chronicled in a series of diplomatic notes and protests. No information regarding the fates of the missing crew members was received.

Summary of U.S. holdings. The files of former Special Assistant to the State Department Legal Advisor, Mr. Samuel Klaus contain extensive documentation of this case. The files are located in the National Archives at Record Group 59, Lot File 64D551. A list of selected documents relating to the RB-50 shootdown is included at Tab D. Copies of the selected documents are appended to this report at Appendix 2.

## Eyewitness accounts

There is much eyewitness evidence in U.S. archival material. The U.S. side interviewed crew members of search planes, personnel from naval vessels, experts on navigation and currents, and the one survivor from the crew to clarify the events of 29 and 30 July. These interviews and affidavits give a detailed picture of what happened to the RB-50. According to the statements of Captain Roche who survived the incident, the plane was hit on the right side and one of the engines was damaged. The alarm was sounded to bail out. Captain Roche was able to exit the aircraft and land safely in the water. He and the pilot, Captain O'Kelly, floated in the water waiting for rescue from 0620 until 1740 on 29 July, when a search plane commanded by Major Gourley dropped an A-3 life boat into the water not far from their position. Captain Roche managed to reach the life boat but Captain O'Kelly disappeared beneath the surface of the sea and is presumed dead. The search plane commanded by Major Gourley requested assistance by radio. At 1928 another search plane commanded by Captain Schneider reached the crash site. Both planes continued to search until 2055 before returning to base. At 0322 on 30 July the USS Picking spotted a rescue flare fired by Captain Roche and successfully rescued him

at 0419. No other survivors were found. The remains of Captain O'Kelley and Master Sergeant Brown were found on the coast of Japan after the search had been discontinued.

On 27 October 1993 Russian interviewers met with A.V. Rybakov, the pilot of the MIG-17 which first engaged the RB-50. Mr. Rybakov declined interview requests with the U.S. side of the Commission. Mr. Rybakov's interview confirmed the facts already established by Soviet documents from 1953, passed to the U.S. side of the Commission by the Russians. He stated that the RB-50 had fired first, that the plane descended into a cloud bank and out of sight without any parachutes being seen, and that he and his wing man, Senior Lieutenant Yablonovsky, returned to Nikolaevka airfield immediately after the incident. Mr. Rybakov stated that he had no knowledge of any part of the plane being recovered, nor did he have any knowledge of survivors.

In November 1994 and again in April 1995, Yuri Mikhailovich Yablonovsky, a retired Soviet Air Force Colonel who was the second pilot involved in the shootdown incident, was interviewed by U.S. interviewers. The information provided by Mr. Yablonovsky confirmed the facts established in the interview with Mr. Rybakov. and in Soviet documents contemporary with the incident.

On 10 June 1993 U.S. interviewers met with retired Soviet Sergeant Georgiy Yakovlevich Kravchenko in Moscow. Mr. Kravchenko served as an anti-aircraft gunner on Russkiy Island near Vladivostok in 1953. Mr. Kravchenko stated that he witnessed the shootdown of the RB-50 from his vantage point on Russkiy Island and that within two minutes of the engagement he saw seven parachutes descending from the burning aircraft.

Information bearing on this case has been presented to the Commission by retired Soviet Colonel (now Professor) Gavril Ivanovich Korotkov a former Soviet military intelligence officer who was stationed in Khabarovsk during the period of the Korean War. Professor Korotkov stated in a taped interview with the British Broadcasting Corporation that he personally interrogated an American prisoner during the Korean War. When the armistice ending the Korean War was signed (27 July 1953) he was in the town of Posyet, located not far from Vladivostok. Professor Korotkov heard that a large U.S. plane had been shot down in the Vladivostok area and had crashed into the sea. He heard that crew members had parachuted from the plane. Colonel Korotkov and other military intelligence

specialists heard that survivors had been picked up by Soviet forces. Consequently, he expected that he and his colleagues would be afforded the opportunity to interrogate the Americans. Colonel Korotkov and his colleagues were told that the war was over and they were forbidden to meet Americans. He stated that survivors were considered spies, not prisoners of war, and as such would be handled by the security services. At the 10<sup>th</sup> Plenary Session of the Commission Professor Korotkov repeated his conviction that several American fliers survived the shootdown and were rescued. Transcripts and reports of selected eyewitness accounts related to this incident are included at Appendix 3.

#### Field investigations

Representatives of the Joint Commission have made several trips to the Far East area in an effort to ascertain the fate of the crew of the RB-50. Two former Soviet prison camps, Magadan and Susuman, have been visited and a trip was made to Vladivostok and Nakhodka in March 1995 to attempt to locate eyewitnesses and confirm archival evidence. Appeals for information on this and other shootdown incidents which occurred in the Vladivostok area were made in local newspapers. To date, the response to the appeals has been positive, however, no new definitive information had been developed. Follow-on visits to the area have been conducted and will be planned on a periodic basis.

#### Current status

As a result of the work of the Joint Commission, the U.S. side has had the opportunity to examine the loss of the RB-50 in some detail. Archival data, eyewitness reports, and the testimony of former Soviet military personnel have contributed to the information available to the Commission.

Efforts are currently underway to locate additional witnesses who can clarify details of the shootdown, particularly the discrepancies regarding parachutes and survivors. Colleagues of Professor Korotkov who may be able to corroborate his statements are being sought. Crew members from Soviet Trawler #423, known to have been in the search area, are also being sought.

The Russian archival record on this incident consists predominantly of documents of a political rather than military/operational nature. Efforts to gain access to additional military/operational

documentation are being undertaken. In particular, unit-level Border Guards records and the deck logs of Soviet ships known to have been in the area of the search are being sought. During a visit to Vladivostok in March 1995, Commission representatives received specific archival citations for some of the deck logs being sought. The logs were sent from the Pacific Fleet Archives in Vladivostok to the Central Naval Archives at Gatchina in the 1960's. During a visit to Gatchina by Commission representatives after the 12<sup>th</sup> Plenary Session, naval archivists agreed to search for the requested deck logs. The Commission still awaits the results of this search

Paramount in the efforts of the Commission is the question of survivors. Thirteen crew members remain unaccounted for. Based on the work conducted to date, no information has been gained to clarify the fates of those unaccounted-for. Circumstantial evidence exists that other crew members in addition to Captain Roche may have survived. The Commission continues its efforts to determine the fates of those still unaccounted for.

## U.S. AIR FORCE RB-47 - - 18 APRIL 1955 - - NORTHERN PACIFIC

## Introduction

Summary of Incident. At approximately 1130 Khabarovsk time on 18 April 1955, an RB-47E assigned to the 4<sup>th</sup> Strategic Reconnaissance Squadron, 26<sup>th</sup> Reconnaissance Wing, based at Eielso AB, Alaska, was shot down with a crew of three over the northern Pacific Ocean off the Kamchatka Peninsula by Soviet MIG fighters. The three crewmen are unaccounted for. A presumptive finding of death was issued by the Air Force on 17 April 1956 (Tab A).

Personnel Involved. RB-47 crew

NEIGHBORS, Lacie C., MAJ Unaccounted For

BROOKS, Robert N., CAPT Unaccounted For

WATKINS, Richard E., Jr., CAPT Unaccounted For

*US position*. The US position prior to the establishment of the Joint Commission was that this plane had been on a routine weather reconnaissance flight when it was attacked by Soviet fighters and shot down over international waters. When the case was presented to the Russian side of the Commission in 1992, the US side acknowledged that the plane had been on an intelligence gathering mission.

*Russian position*. During the work of the Commission, the Russian side has acknowledged from the beginning that the RB-47 was shot down by Soviet aircraft. However, we have no diplomatic documents from either side to indicate whether the USSR believed that this plane violated their state borders, or whether a protest was lodged by the USSR.

Work of the Commission. The US side included the issue of the unaccounted-for crew from the 18 April 1955 shootdown as a formal agenda item at the Joint Commission's first formal session in Moscow, March 1992. To further the work of the Commission, the US side presented a case study to the Russian side in 1993 (Tab B). As reviewed in Archival records section, the Commission has researched archival records relating to this loss. As indicated in the fourth and fifth sections, no eyewitnesses have been interviewed by the Commission, and there was no field investigation given the

loss over the Northern Pacific Ocean. The current status of the Commission's work on this incident is presented in Current status.

#### Live sighting reports

None

## Archival records

Russian. The Russian side has passed to the American side military documents that indicate that the RB-47 was tracked by Soviet signals intelligence units from 0943 Khabarovsk time. The US aircraft was located at that time in the vicinity of Cape Lopatka, at the southern end of the Kamchatka Peninsula. By 1057 the plane was reported 43 miles southeast of Cape Vasiliev. Russian military authorities stated in the documents that the plane did not violate their borders. Nevertheless, two MIG-15 aircraft were scrambled to intercept it, and did so 32 miles east of Cape Kronotski (approximately 55° North, 164° East) at an altitude of 12,200 meters. From 11:25-27, the MIGs attacked the RB-47, and it left Soviet radar screens at 1140 hours.

The crash site was reported by Soviet fishermen aboard the boat "Komandor." They noted an explosion 13 kilometers west of the settlement of Nikol'skoye on Bering Island, approximately 55°, 50 minutes North, 165° 50 minutes East. Soviet intelligence also reported extensively on the American search and rescue (SAR) efforts. The SAR started on 19 April (the dates used by the Soviets in this analysis are one day ahead of ours, owing to the proximity of the International Date Line) and lasted four days using over 20 planes in an extensive SAR effort. However, the Soviet conclusion was "from the nature of the search one can suppose that the Americans do not know the place, cause, and time of the plane's destruction." That is, the plane did not go down where the Americans thought it went down, and so they searched in the wrong place.

The Soviets also mounted a search effort which yielded parts of the aircraft, a life vest, topographic maps of Chukhotka and Alaska, diagrams and a written description of the plane. However, there is no mention of survivors in any Russian document.

The holdings from Russian archives that have been provided to the US side in the work of the Commission are as follows (included with translation at Tab C):

Letter to TsK KPSS from Zhukov	dated 20 April 1955
Letter to TsK KPSS from Zhukov and Molotov	dated 22 April 1955
Note to Molotov and Zhukov from Secretary CC	dated 22 April 1955
Letter to Kuznetsov from Perevertkin	dated April 1955
Message to Colonel Ionev from Zarovskiy	dated 23 April 1955
Memorandum to CC CPSU from Zhukov	dated 28 April 1955
Telegram to Shashenkov from Razumniy	dated 25 April 1955
Recommendation for the Order of the Red Banner	dated 9 September 1955

Memorandum from Border Guards' Troops of the Pacific Fleet

*U.S.* Until 1992, when Russian documents were received, the U.S. government suspected, but could not prove, that the aircraft had been shot down. There is relatively little information in the U.S. archives on this incident. Contemporary accounts of the incident indicate that in 1955 the Air Force knew only that the RB-47 had failed to return from its mission. The Air Force, in its presumptive finding of death of the crew, said that there was no indication that the plane had been shot down by the Soviets, and no mention is made of survivors. The Air Force describes the U.S. SAR effort as 20 sorties comprising 207 search hours, to no avail. Apparently the search for the plane was conducted well away from the actual crash site. Since the US Government had little definitive information that the RB-47 was shot down by Soviet MIGs, no demarches were made to Moscow concerning the fate of the crew.

dated 27 April 1955

Documents from the National Security Agency made available for public release indicate that the US aircraft was shot down by Soviet fighters.

Summary of US holdings. Documents related to this case from US holdings (included at Tab D) are: Incident Chronology

"Soviet Reaction to the flight of a US RB-47"

Telegram to Mrs. Casteel

dated 19 April 1955

Letter to Mrs. Casteel

dated 1955

Excerpts from Unit History of 3d and 10<sup>th</sup> Air Rescue Groups, and Air dated January to June 1955 Rescue Service

Declassified intercept records

Eyewitness accounts

None

Field investigations

None

#### Current status

As a result of the work of the Joint Commission, the US side has had the opportunity to examine the loss of the RB-47 and the fate of the unaccounted-for crew in as much detail as the evidence thus far will allow. Archival data makes it clear that the RB-47 was shot down by Soviet fighters over international waters on 18 April 1955. The US side has asked the GRU to follow-up on the report of the recovery of aircraft parts, life vests and maps referenced at the time of the incident. The US side continues to follow up on reports of the search carried out by Soviet Maritime Border Guard units. Efforts to locate and interview participants in the search operations mounted by the Soviet Border Guards, crew members of the "Komandor," in particular, continue.

Paramount in the efforts of the Commission is the question of survivors. The archival record has yielded no evidence of survivors from this shootdown. There are no reports that parachutes were sighted. There are no references in the documentation from either side to survivors.

46

## U.S. AIR FORCE RB-50 - - 10 SEPTEMBER 1956 - - SEA OF JAPAN

## <u>Introduction</u>

*Summary of Incident*. On 10 September 1956, a USAF RB-50 stationed at Yokota AB, Japan, assigned to the 41<sup>st</sup> Air Division, 5<sup>th</sup> Air Force, was lost over the Sea of Japan. There was a very powerful storm, Typhoon Emma, in the area. No distress signal was received from the RB-50. All sixteen crew members remain unaccounted for. A presumptive finding of death for the crew was issued by the Air Force on 31 December 1956 (Tab A).

Personnel Involved. RB-50 crew

	Unaccounted For
	Unaccounted For
DAVIS, Bobby R., E-6	Unaccounted For
	Unaccounted For
SWINEHART, Paul W., E-5	Unaccounted For
TRAIS, Theodorus J., E-5	Unaccounted For
	Unaccounted For

*U.S. position*. The US position prior to the establishment of the Joint Commission was that the plane was on a weather reconnaissance flight, sent out to check Typhoon Emma. When the case was presented to the Russian side of the Commission in 1992, the US side confirmed that this had been an intelligence gathering flight. The U.S. had no evidence to indicate that the plane's loss resulted from an attack by Soviet fighters. The U.S. did not know if, in fact, the USSR had been involved, whether there had been a Soviet search and rescue effort at the time of the loss or whether either the crew or their remains had been taken by the Soviets.

*Russian position*. On 13 November 1956, in response to a 12 October 1956 U.S. request, the Soviet Government informed the American Embassy in Moscow that the USSR had no information about the aircraft or its crew.

Work of the Commission. The U.S. side included the issue of those unaccounted for from the 10 September 1956 loss as an agenda item at the Joint Commission's first formal session in Moscow, in March 1992. To further the work of the Commission, the U.S. side presented a case study to the Russian side in 1993 (Tab B). The Commission's research on this case is presented in the second through fifth sections. The current status of the Commission's work on this case is presented in Current status.

#### Live sighting reports

None

## Archival records

Russian. The Russian side of the Commission has provided no documents to the US side on this case. The Russian side does not carry this case as a Cold War incident. In Cold War Working Group sessions, the Russian side has indicated that it has no information on this incident. As noted above, in a 13 November 1956 Soviet response to an American request for information, the USSR then stated that it had no information on the loss of the aircraft. During the work of the Commission in response to US requests, the Russian side specifically said it had no search and rescue records relating to the incident.

In spite of the lack of information to date, the Russian side of the Commission pledged during the 11<sup>th</sup> Plenary Session to undertake a renewed effort at locating information related to this incident. The absence of Russian archival materials related to this case is documented at Tab C.

*U.S.* There are few holdings in the U.S. archival records. Air Force files included the accident report (included at Tab D) and the presumptive finding of death (Tab A). Both documents discuss in detail the climatic conditions along the proposed flight path. The presumptive finding of death (Tab A), unit histories, and recently declassified National Security Agency documents (included at Tab D) detail the U.S. search and rescue effort.

The Commission notes that the files of Sam Klaus, former Special Assistant to the State

Department Legal Advisor, which have provided us much information on other incidents, do not contain
information on this incident.

Summary of U.S. holdings. Documents related to this case from U.S. holdings (included at Tab D) are:

Aide-Memoire delivered to Soviet	Ministry of Foreign Affairs	dated 12 October 1956
Alde-Memone denvered to Soviet	IVIIIISU V OL FOLCIGIL ATTAILS	ualeu 12 October 1930

Declassified NSA documents dated 12-14 September 1956

Letter from Assistant Secretary of State Robert Hill to Senator dated 20 March 1957

Knowland

History of the 41<sup>st</sup> Air Division dated 31 December 1956

Report of Aircraft Accident

History of the 3rd Air Rescue Group dated June-December 1956

#### Eyewitness accounts

None

## Field investigation

None

#### Current status

As a result of the work of the Joint Commission, the U.S. side has worked to assemble such information as exists on this case. We find no evidence to indicate that this aircraft loss was caused by hostile Soviet action. The Commission notes that the planned flight path called for the aircraft to go no closer than 120 miles from Soviet territory. This planning reflected technological advances which allowed U.S. aircraft to carry out their classified missions at greater distances from Soviet territory, lessening the chances of attack by the Soviet military.

Turning from the cause of the aircraft's loss, the Commission addressed the question of survivors. Typhoon Emma severely hindered American search and rescue efforts, and it would have had similar effects on any Soviet search. US search efforts were unsuccessful. The Russian side has stated that there were no Soviet SAR operations. During the 11<sup>th</sup> Plenary Session the Russian co-Chairman of the Cold War Working Group told a family member of the missing crew that the Russian side would continue to search for information on the RB-50. At the Cold War Working Group session of the Commission held in Moscow in April 1995 the Russian side reported that it had again researched the loss of the RB-50 and that further information was not found on this case. At this point in the work of the Commission, new leads for further inquiry have not yet been developed.

#### U.S. AIR FORCE C-130 -- 2 SEPTEMBER 1958 -- SOVIET ARMENIA

## Introduction

Summary of Incident. On 2 September 1958, an Air Force C-130 assigned to the 7406<sup>th</sup> Support Squadron in Wiesbaden, Germany, flying out of Incirlik Air Base, Turkey, was shot down by Soviet fighter aircraft in Soviet airspace. The aircraft, with a crew of 17 aboard, crashed and burned near the village of Sasnashen, Soviet Armenia, about 55 kilometers northwest of the capital of Yerevan. On 24 September 1958, six sets of remains were handed over to representatives of the U.S. at the Soviet-Turkish border (the Soviets originally said there were seven sets - U.S. research indicated six sets.) Five of the six have been identified. Eleven crewmen remain unaccounted for. Due to the lack of identification for one set of remains, twelve names are listed as unaccounted for. A presumptive finding of death for the unaccounted for was issued by the Air Force on 9 November 1961 (Tab A).

Personnel Involved. C-130 crew

JERUSS, Edward J., CAPT Remains Identified

SWIESTRA, Rudy J., CAPT Remains Identified

SIMPSON, John E., 1LT Remains Identified

VILLAREAL, Ricardo M., 1LT Remains Identified

BOURG, Archie T., E-3 Remains Identified

DUNCAN, Paul E., CAPT Unaccounted For

PETROCHILOS, George P., E-7 Unaccounted For

MELLO, Arthur L., E-6 Unaccounted For

PRICE, LaRoy, E-5 Unaccounted For

OSHINSKIE, Robert J., E-4 Unaccounted For

FERGUSON, James E. Jr., E-3

Unaccounted For

Unaccounted For

KAMPS, Harold T., E-3	Unaccounted For
	Unaccounted For
	Unaccounted For
MADEIROS, Gerald H., E-3	Unaccounted For
MOORE, Robert H., E-3	Unaccounted For

U.S. position. The U.S. position prior to the establishment of the Joint Commission was that this plane had been on a routine operational flight when it inadvertently strayed into Soviet airspace and was shot down. When the case was presented to the Russian side of the Commission in 1992, the U.S. side acknowledged that it was an intelligence gathering flight.

Russian position. At the time of the incident, the USSR insisted that the plane had crashed on the territory of the USSR with no Soviet fighter involvement. This position was maintained well into 1959, when CPSU General Secretary Khrushchev wrote in response to a query by Vice President Nixon that no Soviet fighters had been involved. At the onset of the Commission's work, the Russian side admitted that the C-130 was shot down by Soviet fighters.

Work of the Commission. The U.S. side included the issue of those unaccounted for from the 2 September 1958 shootdown as a formal agenda item at the Joint Commission's first formal session in Moscow, in March 1992. To further the work of the Commission, the U.S. side presented a case study to the Russian side in 1993 (Tab B). As reviewed in the second through fifth sections, the Commission has researched archival records relating to the incident, interviewed participants and witnesses and carried out a field investigation at the C-130 crash site. The current status of the Commission's work on this incident is presented in Current status.

## Live sighting reports

MOORE, Robert H., E-3

None

## Archival records

Russian. The Russian side of the Commission has provided archival data primarily from two sources. A fairly extensive diplomatic record from the Ministry of Foreign Affairs on this incident, to include Soviet denials of the shootdown has been provided the US side. In January 1993, researchers from the U.S. side of the Commission went to the Central Army Archives in Podol'sk and were allowed to read, but not copy, the Air Defense Forces (PVO) casefile on this incident. Their report is included after the case study at Tab B.

Soviet archival sources indicate that the C-130 was attacked by four MIG-17s, which used cannon and rocket fire to shoot down the plane. The attackers first damaged the right wing. The tail section separated from the fuselage. The aircraft then crashed and burned. The Russian side has passed to the US side gun camera photographs of the shootdown and photographs taken on the ground after the incident which confirm the catastrophic nature of the crash (copies included at Appendix A).

One piece of historical data differs from the rest. In January 1961, an article printed in the Soviet magazine Ogonyok reported that eleven parachutes were seen coming out of the C-130, and that the crewmembers were captured on the outskirts of Yerevan, Armenia. However, this article was a reprint from an East German magazine. Commission researchers obtained a copy of the original German article, in which there is absolutely no mention of parachutes. The Executive Secretary of the Russian side of the Commission informed the U.S. side that the editor of Ogonyok lost his job over this mistake.

The holdings from Russian archives that have been either reviewed or provided to the U.S. side in the work of the Commission are listed at Tab C. The documents with English translations are attached at Appendix I.

*U.S.* The archival record on the U.S. side comes primarily from State Department files, in particular the files of Samuel Klaus. Mr. Klaus was the Special Assistant to the State Department Legal Advisor charged with investigating shootdown incidents with the goal of bringing suit against the USSR in the International Court of Justice for aircraft and human losses suffered as a result of these incidents.

The record indicates clearly that Klaus conducted an energetic investigation. Klaus went to the Turkish-Armenian border area, where he interviewed seven eyewitnesses. He also interviewed many people in the Armenian-American community in California who had recently visited Armenia.

The most detailed, informative document in the US record is the Air Force presumptive finding of death, dated 9 November 1961. This document sums up the incident, considers similar incidents, and makes the following judgement on the possibility of survivors: "Consideration of the information available to the Air Force and factors involved appear to lead to no other logical conclusion than that the subject personnel crashed with the C-130." It is attached at Tab A.

Summary of U.S. holdings. Documents related to this case from U.S. holdings are listed at Tab D. Copies of the documents are attached at Appendix II.

## Eyewitness accounts

Interviews of seven Turkish eyewitnesses in 1959, and of over a dozen eyewitnesses carried out in Armenia in 1993 indicate that none of them saw parachutes emerge from the plane either as it was under attack, or from the time of the attack to the aircraft's crash. According to the Armenian eyewitnesses, representatives of the security services were on site shortly after the crash to supervise cleanup operations.

At the Sixth Plenary session in September 1993, both sides in the Cold War Working Group heard the testimony of retired Soviet General Valentin Sozinov, a colonel at the time, who had given the order to shoot down the plane, and who was at the crash site moments after impact. Sozinov said that the plane was an inferno, and that it burned for about eight hours. He said that no one could have survived the crash. General Sozinov's statement to the Commission is at Tab E.

At the Ninth Plenary session in June 1994, former Soviet pilot First Lieutenant Viktor Lopatkov, who was assigned at the time to the 25<sup>th</sup> Fighter Air Regiment, testified before the Cold War Working Group. He was one of the pilots who shot down the C-130. He described how he and his mates attacked the plane. He himself did not see the plane's actual crash, as he was caught in the C-

130's slipstream and was fighting to save his aircraft. Neither did he hear any rumors about survivors. Lopatkov's statement is at Tab F.

## Field investigation

In August 1993, the U.S. side of the Joint Commission went to Armenia to conduct an investigation of the crash site. The Commission, led by U.S. Co-chairman Ambassador Malcolm Toon, inspected the crash site, conducted interviews of witnesses to the incident, and oversaw the beginning of the site excavation work of the team from the Army's Central Identification Laboratory, Hawaii (CILHI).

The CILHI team looked for evidence of human remains, as well as pieces of the plane and its contents, which might provide clues as to how many crewmen were aboard when the aircraft crashed and burned. The CILHI team was on-site for over two weeks, and in October 1993 issued its interim report. The team recovered hundreds of skeletal fragments. However, all were too small on which to perform DNA matching. Artifacts possible related to crew survival gear were brought to Hawaii to be analyzed by aircrash analysts. The report of the CILHI team is at Tab G.

#### Current status

As a result of the work of the Joint Commission, the U.S. side has had the opportunity to examine the loss of the C-130 and the fate of the crew still unaccounted for in considerable detail. Archival data, eyewitness accounts, the accounts of officers of the former Soviet Union who actually participated in the downing of the aircraft and the on-site investigation of the crash site have contributed to the information available to the Commission. The U.S. side continues to seek the after-action reports prepared by the security services and the forensic services of the former USSR to make an even fuller account available as a result of the Commission's work.

At the Cold War Working Group session of the Commission held in Moscow in April 1995, a Russian forensic specialist from the Ministry of Defense agreed to research questions related to the forensic work conducted by the Soviets at the time of the incident. The Russian side also agreed to search for additional forensic records related to this incident. This work is still on-going.

A key question addressed by the Commission is whether any member or members of the crew of the C-130 were able to parachute from the aircraft or survive the attack. The statements of participants in the attack and of eyewitnesses to the attack are strikingly similar. Their statements agree that no parachutes were sighted coming from the C-130, there was neither evidence nor rumors of crash survivors, and that no one could have survived the violent impact and hours-long inferno that engulfed the destroyed aircraft. The CILHI excavation of the crash site lends support to the statements of both the participants and eyewitnesses.

## U.S. AIR FORCE RB-47 - - 1 JULY 1960 - - BARENTS SEA

## Introduction

Summary of Incident. On 1 July 1960, an RB-47 aircraft stationed at Brize-Norton AB, England, assigned to the 55<sup>th</sup> Strategic Reconnaissance Wing, carrying a crew of six, was shot down by a Soviet fighter during conduct of a reconnaissance mission. American search and rescue efforts recovered no survivors or remains. A Soviet trawler picked up two survivors, Captains John R. McKone and Freeman B. Olmstead. They were imprisoned in the Soviet Union until January 1961 when they were repatriated. A Soviet search and rescue crew also recovered the body of the pilot, Captain Willard G. Palm. Captain Palm's body was returned to U.S. authorities on 25 July 1960. In October 1960 the Soviets recovered but did not repatriate the body of Major Eugene E. Posa. Major Posa and the remaining two crew members are unaccounted for. An official report of death was issued on the unaccounted-for crew members on 30 June 1961 (Tab A).

Personnel Involved. RB-47 crew

PALM, Willard G., MAJ Remains repatriated

MCKONE, John R., CAPT Survived/Repatriated

OLMSTEAD, Freeman B. CAPT Survived/Repatriated

POSA, Eugene E., MAJ

Unaccounted for

GOFORTH, Oscar L., CAPT Unaccounted for

PHILLIPS, Dean B., CAPT Unaccounted for

*U.S. position*. The U.S. position prior to the establishment of the Joint Commission was that the plane was on an electromagnetic research flight over international waters when it was shot down. When the case was presented to the Russian side of the Commission in 1992, the U.S. position was that the plane was on a reconnaissance flight and was shot down over international waters.

57

Russian position. The Russian side included this case on their original list of ten Cold War incidents which they presented at the second Plenary session in September 1992. They acknowledged shooting down this plane after it allegedly violated Soviet airspace.

Work of the Commission. The U.S. side included the issue of those unaccounted-for from the 1 July 1960 shootdown as an agenda item at the Joint Commission's first formal session in Moscow, in March 1992. To further the work of the Commission, the U.S. side presented a case study to the Russian side in 1993 (Tab B). As reviewed in the second through fifth sections, the Commission has researched archival records related to this incident and has interviewed participants in the shootdown and the search and rescue operations which followed. The current status of the Commission's work on this incident is presented in Current status.

## Live sighting reports

None

#### Archival records

*Russian*. The documents on this case provided by the Russian side deal primarily with the repatriation of the survivors, the repatriation of Major Palm's remains and the transfer of the body of Major Posa.

The Soviets shot down the plane north of Cape Svyatoy Nos (Holy Nose). The Soviets stated that the plane had violated Soviet airspace within the 12 mile limit. The American survivors contended that they were a full 50 miles off the Soviet coast when the attack took place.

Soviet maritime vessels picked up the two survivors and Major Palm's body from the Barents Sea. Captains McKone and Olmstead were taken to Moscow and put in Lubyanka Prison, where they were interrogated at great length by Soviet security services. Captains McKone and Olmstead were subsequently tried and found guilty of espionage. They were released from prison in January 1961.

Major Palm's body was found on 4 July 1960 and was returned to U.S. authorities on 25 July 1960.

A document provided by the Russian side indicates that the body of Major Eugene Posa was recovered from the Berents Sea by a fishing trawler in October 1960. According to this document the body was to have been transferred on 17 October 1960 to Severomorsk. At technical talks held in Moscow in February 1996, the Russian co-Chairman of the Cold War Working Group read from a document which stated that Major Posa's remains had, in fact, been transferred to Severomorsk (see Current status section).

Another document, a written statement from Captain Poliashov of the fishing trawler "Yalta", dated 25 October 1961, indicates that, on 13 October 1961 a Soviet trawler raised "part of a human leg, one boot and a sock." This was badly decomposed and was thrown back into the sea by the trawler's captain.

The documents provided by the Russian side to date make no mention of survivors other than Captain McKone and Captain Olmstead.

The documents from the Russian archives which have been provided to the U.S. side in the work of the Commission are as follows (with translations - at Tab C):

#### Incident map

Statement: transfer of body of Captain Palm	dated 25 July 1960
Statement: confirmation of transfer	dated 25 July 1960
Report to Commander in Chief of Air Defense Forces	dated 22 September 1960
Letter to Khrushchev from Shelepin	dated 17 October 1960
Resolution of Presidium CPSU	dated 25 January 1961
Resolution on closing the case	dated 28 January 1961
Explanation of Captain Poliashev from Fishing Trawler "Yalta"	dated 25 October 1961

*U.S.* The documentary record on the U.S. side is fairly complete. A detailed summary of the case is contained in the USAF Report of Death (Tab A). The Soviet government first announced they had picked up and were holding two survivors of the crash in an account of the incident given on 11 July

1960. This Soviet announcement opened an extensive exchange of diplomatic correspondence between the United States and Soviet governments. In the diplomatic exchange, the United States government repeatedly requested the release of the two survivors. On 25 January, in a political overture to the new American administration of President Kennedy, the Soviet Union released the two imprisoned flyers.

The Soviet contention that the RB-47 had violated the airspace of the Soviet Union was heard in the United Nations Security Council from 22 July 1960 to 26 July 1960. The texts of the Soviet draft resolution and the statements by U.S. Ambassador Henry Cabot Lodge are attached at Tab D.

Summary of U.S. Holdings. Documents related to the incident from U.S. holdings are (at Tab D):

# Fact Sheet

#### Editorial Note

State Department Bulletin excerpts	dated 1,8,15 and 22 August 1960
Summary of USAF RB-47 lost in Barents Sea	15 August 1960
Aide-Memoire from Soviet Government to US Government	dated 21 January 1961
Telegram to SecState from Ambassador Thompson	dated 21 January 1961 10:06 am
Telegram to Ambassador Thompson from State Department	dated 23 January 1961 5:57 pm
Aide-Memoire from US Government to Soviet Government	dated 23 January 1961 6:56 pm
Declassified NSA documents	3 - 6 July 1960

1-4-11015 ---100

## Eyewitness statements

The recollections of the two surviving American crew members from this plane, Captain McKone and Captain Olmstead are documented in the book, The Little Toy Dog, (White, William L., The Little Toy Dog, E.F. Dutton & Co., Inc., New York, 1962.) While descending into the sea after ejecting from the plane, Captain Olmstead recalled seeing three open parachutes in addition to his own.

Captain McKone recalled seeing two in addition to his own. Neither of the survivors saw any of the other crew members after the incident.

The Commission has interviewed more than twenty Russian citizens who had some knowledge of this incident. Those interviewed include participants in the shootdown incident and participants in the subsequent search and rescue operations.

The pilot of the plane which shot down the RB-47, Vasiliy Polyakov, was interviewed on 31 May 1995. He stated that on 1 July 1960 he was on strip alert when he was scrambled to intercept an intruding plane. He approached the plane and identified it visually as an American bomber. He waved the wings of his plane in an attempt to signal the American plane to land. When the American plane gave no response, the ground navigator gave the command to destroy the aircraft. Polyakov fired, the RB-47 burst into flames and began to sharply roll upside down. Polyakov observed the RB-47 until it descended into the clouds. He did not see any parachutes, nor did he see the plane crash into the sea.

Information on the possible location of the remains of Major Posa was gained in an interview with Retired Admiral Lev Garkusha, a former commander of the naval headquarters at Gremikha, a base at which Major Posa's remains were said to have been. In the fall of 1960, Admiral Garkusha was informed by a duty officer that a trawler had recovered parts of a plane and bodies. He personally saw the bodies and remembered there were more than two, perhaps three or four. He received an order to send the bodies and airplane parts to Northern Fleet Headquarters in Severomorsk. They were sent there on Patrol Boat #72 after being at Gremikha for about two hours. Several days later, Admiral Garkusha was informed by telephone that the bodies had been received at Severomorsk and sent from there to Moscow. He did not know exactly where in Moscow the bodies were sent.

The Commission has also received information from a former crew member on a Soviet fishing trawler, Mr. Georgiy Gurinovich who reported that in late July 1960 he personally recovered a leg from the water near the RB-47 crash site. The leg was tangled in the fishing net of his trawler, had a boot on it and was wrapped in parachute lines. The trawler's captain had the leg buried at sea.

## Field investigations

#### None

## Current status

As a result of the work of the Joint Commission, the US side has had the opportunity to examine the loss of the RB-47 in some detail. Archival data and interviews with Russian citizens have contributed to the information available to the Commission.

Efforts to locate witnesses to this incident who might clarify the fate of those unaccounted for from the crew of the RB-47 continue. Additional documentation is also being sought on this incident. At technical talks held in February 1996, the Russian co-Chairman read from a document which stated that the remains of Major Posa were, in fact, transferred to Severomorsk. The Russian side agreed to review the document for declassification and release. The Russian side has also volunteered to undertake a review of the criminal proceedings against the two American survivors in an attempt to locate additional information relevant to the fates of those still unaccounted for. The U.S. side continues to pursue leads on the possible location of the remains of Major Posa and other crew members.

Paramount in the efforts of the Commission is the question of survivors. Other than Captain McKone and Captain Olmstead who survived and were later repatriated, there have been no references to survivors in archival evidence from either side, nor do the results of more than twenty interviews indicate that there were survivors of the shootdown incident.

#### U.S. AIR FORCE RB-57 - - 14 DECEMBER 1965 - - BLACK SEA

## Introduction

*Summary of Incident*. On 14 December 1965, a USAF RB-57 was lost over the southern Black Sea. The aircraft was assigned to the 7407<sup>th</sup> Support Squadron at Wiesbaden, Germany, and was on temporary duty at Incirlik AB, Turkey. A joint Turkish-American search effort began on 15 December 1965, and found parts of the plane but neither of the two-man crew. Presumptive findings of death for the crew were issued by the Air Force in June 1966 (Tab A).

Personnel Involved. RB-57 crew

LACKEY, Lester L., MAJ

Unaccounted For

Unaccounted For

*U.S. position*. The U.S. position prior to the establishment of the Joint Commission was that the plane had been on a routine flight and crashed in the Black Sea. We had no evidence to indicate that the plane's loss resulted from an attack by Soviet fighters. The U.S. did not know whether there had been a Soviet search and rescue effort or whether the crew or their remains had been taken by the Soviets.

Russian position. At the time of the incident, on 24 December 1965, Soviet Deputy Foreign Minister Kuznetsov called in U.S. Ambassador Kohler and, in a carefully worded, prepared statement, lectured him about U.S. reconnaissance flights near Soviet borders, to include the 14 December flight. Kohler asked specifically for information about the incident and raised questions about Soviet interference with the plane. Kuznetsov would not elaborate on his prepared remarks.

Work of the Commission. The U.S. side included the issue of those unaccounted for from the 14 December 1965 incident as a formal agenda item at the Joint Commission's first formal sesion in Moscow, in March 1992. This incident was not included in the cases on which the Russian side presented data at the September 1992 Plenum. The Russian side indicated it did not consider this as a shootdown case. To further the work of the Commission, the U.S. side presented a case study to the Russian side in 1993 (Tab B). As reviewed in the Archival records section, the Commission has researched archival records relating to the loss. The Commission has also addressed this loss incident in

meetings with leaders of other former Soviet republics. As indicated in the fourth and fifth sections, no eyewitnesses have been discovered by the Commission, and there was no field investigation given the loss over the Black Sea. The Commission's work is presented in the Current status section.

## Live sighting reports

None

#### Archival records

*Russian*. The Russian side has provided two documents bearing on this incident. Both documents address the Soviet search operations. These operations succeeded in recovering parts of the RB-57. There is no mention in these documents of survivors.

These holdings from the Russian archives as provided to the U.S. side in the work of the Commission are as follows (in translation - at Tab C):

Message 18 December 1965 Admiral of the Navy Gorshkov to Minister of Defense Marshal Malinovsky

Message 20 December 1965 Minister of Defense Marshal Malinovsky to Central Committee Communist Party of the Soviet Union

*U.S.* As a result of the Commission's work, certain American records have been recovered on this incident. The loss of the plane resulted in a joint U.S.-Turkish search effort, which succeeded in recovering parts of the aircraft. The accident report described the aircraft as a total loss. Documents related to the incident from U.S. holdings (Tab D) are:

Aircraft Incident Report	dated 13 January 1966
Telegram to Amembassy Paris	dated 15 December 1965 12:11 pm
Telegram to Amembassy Moscow	dated 15 December 1965 4:23 pm
Telegram to State from Amembassy Ankara	dated 16 December 1965 8:05 am
Telegram to State from Amembassy Ankara	dated 16 December 1965 8:56 am

Telegram to Amembassy Ankara	dated 16 December 1965 12:08 pm
Telegram to SecState from Amembassy Ankara	dated 16 December 1965 12:52 pm
Telegram to Secstate from Amembassy Ankara	16 December 1965 3:27 pm
Telegram to Amembassy Ankara	dated 16 December 1965 5:58 pm
Telegram to Amembassy Ankara	dated 17 December 1965 12:59 pm
Telegram to SecState from Amembassy Ankara	dated 17 December 1965 7:06 am
Telegram to SecState from Amembassy Ankara	dated 18 December 1965 5:16 am
Telegram to SecState from Amembassy Ankara	dated 22 December 1965 8:47 am
Telegram to SecState from Amembassy Moscow	dated 24 December 1965 2:02pm
Telegram to Amembassy Moscow and Amembassy Ankara	dated 24 December 1965 4:37 pm
Telegram to Secstate from Amembassy Ankara	dated 27 December 1965 7:28 am
Missing Persons Supplementary Report	dated 28 December 1965
Telegram to Amembassy Ankara and Amembassy Moscow	dated 28 December 1965 6:43 pm
Telegram to Amembassy Moscow and Amembassy Ankara	dated 6 January 1966 6:10 pm
Message Traffic to General Greene	dated 25 January 1966
Message Traffic to General Greene	dated 31 January 1966
Message Traffic to CSAF	dated 4 June 1966

Diplomatic communications at the time indicated that while there was initial speculation regarding Soviet involvement, it was ruled out. Most cables centered on the Turkish involvement in the search effort, and on the need for discretion regarding American bases in Turkey.

The archival record indicates that while both sides were successful in searching for the plane, the crew was not found. None of the US documents mentions survivors of the lost aircraft.

## Eyewitness statements

None

## Field investigations

None

## Current status

As a result of the work of the Joint Commission, the U.S. side has had the opportunity to examine the loss of the RB-57 and its crew in detail.

The Commission has reviewed the archival data presented by both sides. There is no evidence indicating that the aircraft was lost to hostile action. It is clear that the US and Soviet militaries tracked the plane on their radars and knew with relative certainty when and where the aircraft crashed. Both sides conducted Black Sea search and rescue operations in which parts of the RB-57 were recovered. There is no reference in any document to survivors of the crash. At this point in the work of the Commission, new leads for further inquiry have not yet been developed.

## **SOVIET LOSSES IN AFGHANISTAN**

## Introduction

Summary of Incident. The Soviet conflict against the Afghan rebels, the Mujahadeen, lasted from 24 December 1979 until 16 February 1989. During this conflict, the Soviet Union lost 13,833 military personnel. Following the withdrawal of Soviet forces from Afghanistan, the Soviet military listed 315 servicemen as Missing In Action or Prisoners of War.

*U.S. Position Prior to Commission*. The United States assisted the former Soviet Union in obtaining information and facilitating exchanges of POWs following the Soviet withdrawal from Afghanistan. On 13 September 1991, the United States and the Soviet Union issued the U.S.-Soviet Joint Statement on Afghanistan. Secretary of State James Baker and Soviet Foreign Minister Eduard Shevardnadze agreed that the U.S. would assist, to the highest degree possible, in the effort to return Soviet POWs from Afghanistan. This agreement led to an intensification of U.S. efforts.

In accordance with this agreement, Mr. Peter Tomsen, Special Envoy to Afghanistan and the Mujahadeen from 1989 until 1993, travelled throughout Afghanistan to collect information and press for the release of POWs. He met with resistance commanders, tribal leaders and politicians, turned over information and lists of POWs from the Soviet Veterans Association, and met with Western travellers, including correspondents, in Afghanistan. The information gained through these efforts was turned over to the Russian government.

The U.S. intelligence community also provided information on Soviet missing in Afghanistan. In November 1991, a list of 16 servicemen believed to be held by the Mujahadeen was turned over to the Russian government. This list is attached at Tab A.

## Work of the Commission

*Initial Efforts*. At the first Plenary Session in Moscow in March 1992, the Commission included the subject of former Soviet servicemen missing in action in Afghanistan as part of the official work of the Commission. At this initial meeting, the U.S. side presented a U.S. government list of 57 Soviet POW/MIAs in Afghanistan, three photographs of Soviet POWs and a videotape of a Soviet POW.

The U.S. side also turned over a list of 19 former POWs from Afghanistan then living in the West, the names of seven former Soviet soldiers who had returned to the former Soviet Union and a list 16 former Soviet soldiers believed to still be held by the Mujahedeen.

During the early stages of the Commission's work, additional documentation was passed by the U.S. side. One document, compiled with the assistance of governments in the Afghan region and the International Committee of the Red Cross (ICRC), provided details on 7-8 former Soviet soldiers and their captors. Another document provided information on Soviet soldiers who were living in the mountains of the "Black Valley" region of Afghanistan.

In August 1994, the U.S. co-Chairman of the Cold War Working Group presented information to the Russian side on the location of two Russian servicemen who disappeared in Afghanistan and the names of the Mujahedeen commanders holding them. Subsequently, the U.S. and Russian sides agreed to include the discussions on Soviet losses in Afghanistan as part of the work of the Cold War Working Group.

Copies of all the documents mentioned above are included at Tab B.

The Cold War Working Group. The Russian side of the Commission turned over a list of 290 former Soviet servicemen considered missing in action or prisoners of war in Afghanistan. This list continues to serve as the foundation for the work of the Commission on this issue. The Russian side has stressed that although information may indicate that some of these men are dead, Russian military protocol dictates that two witnesses are required to declare a soldier dead. Therefore, all of these servicemen are considered MIA/POW. A copy of this list is located at

Tab C.

The U.S. side conducted a detailed analysis of this list and created a computerized, annotated, database which was presented to the Russian side. Commission efforts have assisted the Russian government in reducing the number of missing servicemen to 287 (see the third section).

*Meetings with Foreign Officials*. In addition to the documentary information exchanged by both sides of the Commission, U.S. government officials have met with Afghan and Pakistani leaders in order to

push for the release of former Soviet POWs. Since the inception of the Commission, the U.S. co-Chairman of the Commission, Ambassador Malcolm Toon, and other Commission members have met with Afghan leaders, including the President, Prime Minister, Foreign Minister, Defense Minister and Charge d'affaires to urge them to work for the release of any former Soviet servicemen still held as POWs.

On 3 May 1995, Ambassador Toon and staff members met with the Afghan Charge d'affaires and a representative from the Afghan Ministry of Defense. The Afghan charge stated that no more than 20-30 former Soviet servicemen were being held against their will in Afghanistan at that time.

Ambassador Toon turned over the 290 list and requested the Afghan government investigate these cases and provide the U.S. any new information on these servicemen as it becomes available.

The U.S. side sent copies of the 290 list to U.S. Embassies in the Afghan region and the Middle East and requested that the host governments provide any information concerning the missing soldiers to the Commission for passage to the Russian side.

Additionally, in meetings with representatives of the Newly Independent States of the Former Soviet Union the U.S. side has presented information on former Soviet servicemen missing from the war in Afghanistan who came from these countries.

#### Archival records

U.S. In January 1995, under the auspices of the Cold War Working Group, the U.S. side of the Commission initiated an exhaustive search of U.S. government archives for information on missing Soviet servicemen in Afghanistan. At technical talks held in Moscow in February 1995, the U.S. delegation turned over information and extracts from 42 Department of State documents and nine documents from the U.S. intelligence community. At working group meetings in April 1995 in Moscow, the U.S. side of the Commission turned over the text of the aforementioned 42 Department of State documents, the text of 40 additional State department documents, the text of 30 documents from the personal files of Special Envoy Peter Tomsen, and information extracted from some 150 intelligence community documents. At the Twelfth Plenary Session held in August 1995, the U.S. side turned over

19 Department of State documents. This information represents a complete and exhaustive search of all available U.S. government files.

The listing of documents from U.S. archives that have been provided to the Russian side in the work of the Commission is attached in Tab D.

*Russian*. Since March 1992, the Russian side of the Commission has provided several lists of servicemen missing in Afghanistan as the number of missing has been reduced. In 1992, the Russian side of the Commission provided a list of 22 priority cases of missing servicemen in Afghanistan and the commanders holding them.

#### Current status

During the Twelfth Plenary Session of the Commission held in August 1995, the Russian side indicated that two servicemen, Nikolai Bystrov and Byashimgel'dy Yazhkanov, had recently returned. (Note: Nikolai Bystrov does not appear on the U.S. side's copy of the 290 list). The Russian side also indicated that two additional servicemen, Mumin Altyev and Dovletnazar Gulgeldiev, had been located and contacted by both family members and government officials, but decided not to return to the former Soviet Union. Even though these servicemen did not return, the Russian side informed the U.S. side that these men were no longer considered POW/MIA. Based on this information, the list of 290 has been reduced to 287 missing soldiers.

At the Twelfth Plenary Session, the Russian side emphasized that the Russian government knew the names and current locations of all POWs held in Afghanistan. The Russian side requested that the U.S. focus its efforts on assisting in the release of these men. The U.S. side will request that the Afghan Embassy in Washington and governments in the region of Afghanistan turn over any additional information on former Soviet servicemen in Afghanistan and continue to press for the release of any POWs still held against their will. In response to a suggestion by the Russian side of the Commission, the U.S. side stated it would be pleased to receive names requiring priority attention from the 287 list. The U.S. side has not received such a list at this time. The U.S. side continues to be responsive to Russian requests.

## **SOVIET COLD WAR LOSSES**

## Introduction

Throughout the course of the Commission's work, the Russian side of the Commission has inquired about 28 specific Cold War era incidents of Soviet losses of aircraft, submarines and personnel, and requested the U.S. side investigate these incidents. A list of these incidents is located at Tab A.

## Work of the Commission

Since the First Plenary Session of the Commission, efforts by the U.S. side to uncover information on Russian requests have taken place under the guidance of the Cold War Working Group. The U.S. side of the Commission has conducted a broad search of U.S. government archives to investigate the incidents raised by the Russian side. The U.S. side searched for information from the Joint Staff, the Navy Historical Center, the Office of the Assistant Secretary of Defense for International Security Affairs, U.S. Army Center of Military History, the Department of the Navy, Department of the Air Force, the Office of Naval Intelligence, the U.S. intelligence community, the Department of State and the National Archives. In addition, members of the U.S. side of the Commission met with officials at the highest level of the intelligence community in the investigation of these incidents.

In October 1992, the United States government turned over a video tape of the burial at sea of the remains of six crew members of the Soviet Golf-class submarine which sank in 1968. These bodies were recovered during a salvage operation conducted by the United States in 1974. On 30 August 1993, the U.S. Co-Chairman of the Commission, Ambassador Malcolm Toon, turned over the bell of the Golf-class sub to the Deputy Director of the Russian Foreign Intelligence Service. In May 1994, members of the U.S. side of the Commission presented a picture of a Soviet sailor to the Russian government. This picture was retrieved from film recovered during the 1974 salvage operation. During working group sessions held in April 1995, the U.S. side turned over extracts from the deck logs of the U.S.S. Swordfish from March 1968. The information on this incident which has been passed by the U.S. side of the Commission represents all available information on this Soviet loss.

The U.S. side of the Commission also presented information on the 25 May 1968 crash of a Soviet Tu-16 "Badger" in the Norwegian Sea. During working group sessions held in April 1995, the U.S. side turned over the Deck Log and Command History of the U.S.S. Essex for May 1968. At the Twelfth Plenary Session in August 1995, the U.S. side passed to the Russian side film footage of the crash of the Tu-16 taken from the U.S.S. Essex as well as a written eyewitness testimony of this incident.

In April 1995, during working group sessions, the U.S. side passed over the deck logs of the U.S.S. Bennington from 1 July 64 to 31 July 1964, the deck log of the U.S.S. Cunningham from 14 July 1964 to 16 July 1964 and the deck log of the U.S.S. Eversole from 14 July 1964 to 16 July 1964. These deck logs all pertain to the crash of a Soviet Tu-16r "Badger" on 15 July 1964 in the Sea of Japan.

In addition to the information described above, the U.S. side of the Commission has passed extensive information on several other cases. The Navy Historical Center turned over seven pages of information on a Soviet twin engine bomber shot down off the coast of Korea on 4 September 1950. This information included medical reports and a photograph of the pilot's body which was recovered by the U.S.S. Philippine Sea. The Joint Staff gathered 17 additional pages of information on this incident, including incident reports, statements from the pilots and combat charts.

The U.S. side of the Commission has also turned over information on 12 additional Soviet loss incidents, including information on eight Soviet advisors captured in the Ogaden in 1978. This information begins to clarify the circumstances surrounding these incidents. In some cases, when no information was found, reports documenting U.S. efforts have been passed to the Russian side. Copies of all the documents described above are located at Tab B.

#### Current status

The U.S. side of the Commission continues its efforts to uncover further information on each of the Russian requests addressing Soviet Cold War losses.